

Public and Nonprofit Marketing: A Review and Directions for Future Research

Noel Capon and Elizabeth Cooper-Martin

Important differences between public/nonprofit and for-profit organizations are highlighted. Research on public and nonprofit marketing is organized by marketing topic, critically reviewed and integrated. Future research directions to advance the public and nonprofit marketing field, organized by the key differences, are identified.

INTRODUCTION

During the past 20 years, public and nonprofit (PNP) marketing has emerged as an important subfield within the marketing discipline. PNP marketing focuses on the use of marketing concepts and strategies by charitable, scientific, educational, recreational, social, cultural, political, civic, government, trade or professional and religious organizations (Rados 1981).

The birth of PNP marketing was marked by controversy: should marketing concepts and principles be applied to PNP organizations? and what is marketing? Kotler and Levy's (1969a) classic paper, "Broadening the Concept of Marketing," expanded marketing's domain beyond for-profit (FP) business activity and interpreted marketing concepts and principles for non-

Noel Capon is Professor of Business, Graduate School of Business, Columbia University, New York. Elizabeth Cooper-Martin is Assistant Professor, School of Business Administration, Georgetown University, Washington, D.C. Author Capon acknowledges support from the Redward Foundation.

business organizations. Luck (1969) argued that marketing should be limited to market transactions and not applied to PNP's. Kotler and Levy (1969b) contended that expansion of marketing's domain would assist both business and nonbusiness marketing; that marketing functions did occur in PNPs; and that marketing embraced exchanges in general, not solely market exchanges.

Ten years ago, Lovelock and Weinberg (1978) declared that PNP marketing had come of age in terms of pedagogy, applications and publications. Kotler's (1975) textbook, *Marketing for Nonprofit Organizations*, and Lovelock and Weinberg's (1977) case book were important spurs to course development. Growing interest in PNP marketing led Capon and Mauser (1982) to review five PNP texts or casebooks and note seven more specialized books.

The current state of PNP marketing deserves attention for several reasons. First, PNPs differ from FPs in ways that have important marketing implications. Second, PNPs are a significant economic force; the public sector employs over 14% of the U.S. labor force (1975) and accounts for 18% of GNP (1980) (Rudney 1981) and the private, nonprofit sector employs over 7% of the labor force (1985) (Johnston and Rudney 1986) and accounts for 6% of GNP (1980) (Rudney 1981). Third, PNP marketing, dated from Kotler and Levy's (1969a) paper, is now 20 years old. Finally, Lovelock and Weinberg's (1978) previous review was published over 10 years ago.

Our goal is to summarize research in PNP marketing and suggest directions for future work. The review covers all marketing topics, including strategy and planning. We deal with both public and government organizations (P) and private, not-for-profit organizations (NP). Since there are important differences between Ps and NPs, our work embraces much diversity.

First, we isolate important differences between FPs and PNPs. Second, we present a typology of research for evaluating the field's progress. Third, we review extant research in PNP marketing. Finally, we suggest future research directions for PNP marketing.

DIFFERENCES BETWEEN PNP AND FP ORGANIZATIONS

The underlying rationale for a PNP marketing review is that PNP and FP marketing differ. In this section we summarize frequently mentioned PNP versus FP differences and add insights on corporate strategy. Our goal is to introduce concepts and ideas common to study of PNPs and prepare for discussing directions for future research, presented later in the paper.

Although PNPs and FPs generally differ on the dimensions we identify, in some cases they may be quite similar. Nonetheless, the following seven differences are sufficiently robust to define the field: Exchange, Organiza-

tion Goals and Objectives, Corporate Strategy, Multiple Publics, Offerings, Public Scrutiny, Market Exposure and Competition.

Exchange

A basic tenet of FP marketing is voluntary exchange of goods and services for a monetary price. In PNP marketing, exchanges are more complex and not always clear. Money flows to PNPs are often not for goods and services, but for good feelings, social status, peer approval and legal compliance. Offerings are frequently provided for zero price. Besides goods and services, PNPs offer ideas, causes and requests for behavior change.

PNPs receive much less funds from sales of products and services, zero in many cases. NPs receive funds from donors; Ps from taxpayers. Funders may not be customers; for example, donors to colleges may not attend and taxpayers may not use fire, park or public school services.

Organization Goals and Objectives

Goals and objectives differ between PNPs and FPs in three general ways. First, FPs emphasize financial goals and objectives (Rainey, Backoff and Levine 1976) since organization benefits accrue to stockholders (Selby 1978). Goals for PNPs tend to be more subjective and less tangible and measurable. Since PNPs benefit service recipients and cannot pass monetary profits or surplus to individuals, financial gain is less relevant (Rados 1981). Furthermore, PNPs provide outlets for satisfying human nature and have aesthetic, spiritual, intellectual or social goals.

Second, multiple constituencies lead PNPs to have many, diverse goals and objectives; FPs typically focus on a small set: stock price, profits, sales, growth (Lovelock and Weinberg 1978). Although FPs have other objectives (e.g., social responsibility), these do not typically dominate.

Third, conflict and trade-offs among goals and objectives are more likely in PNPs since satisfying many objectives simultaneously is difficult. Consider, for example, goals faced by New York City in considering the proposed Westway highway project. Among the demands were: commuters—the route; trade unions—the jobs; real estate interests—the development; local residents—no traffic; city dwellers—trade-in option for mass transit.¹

In some cases, however, PNPs act like FPs. For example, volume and revenue goals may be extremely important (e.g., student enrollment for ed-

¹Note that this controversy has been solved; the trade-in option was chosen.

educational institutions; numbers of patients for hospitals). Furthermore, for-profit ventures of PNPs may have bottom-line profit goals.

Corporate Strategy

Corporate Strategy constrains marketing strategy; below, we discuss selected dimensions.

Diversification strategy. Many major FPs have diversified from single businesses to multi-product, multi-market organizations (Rumelt 1974). By contrast, because of restricted missions, PNPs generally focus in a single product/market domain. Diversifications are typically closely related to the core activity; for example, colleges may run conference centers or operate hotels on campus. However, some organizations (e.g., YMCA) are more diversified than others.

International strategy. Significant revenues and manufacturing of many large FPs are overseas (Capon, Farley and Hulbert 1988). PNPs typically operate in single nation-states; exceptions are Amnesty International, international relief agencies and tourist boards.

New product and service strategies. FPs pursue growth objectives by adding new products and services from R&D efforts and/or mergers and acquisitions. PNPs do not typically fund R&D. Mergers and acquisitions typically occur among similar entities and NPs, in general, are more reluctant than FPs to merge (Sterne 1989).

Divestiture strategies. To focus resources, FPs frequently divest business units. PNP divestiture occurs infrequently because of low levels of diversification, because PNP managers believe strongly in their causes (Drucker 1989) and because of pressure from various publics.

Multiple Publics

PNPs have more significant publics than FPs and thus more groups from which to seek resources (Rainey, Backoff and Levine 1976). FPs receive capital from stockholders and creditors, and return dividends and interest; profits result from selling goods and services. FP marketing is directed mainly at prospective customers, although FPs must increasingly respond to other groups (e.g., environmentalists—Exxon after the 1989 Alaska oil spill).

NPs receive funds from donors; Ps from taxpayers. Other key PNP publics are voters and volunteers. Voters are important for some Ps as they (not users) determine elected officials' survival and thus, organizational missions. Volunteers provide key resources and voluntarism distinguishes NPs; cost pressures have also led to volunteers in Ps (e.g., teacher's aides).

Offerings

FPs offer customers physical goods and services. PNPs rarely offer physical goods but typically provide services or other intangibles such as ideas, causes and values (Rados 1981). PNPs also attempt to change knowledge, behavior or values (Bloom and Novelli 1981).²

Some PNPs, especially Ps, offer public goods, (e.g., national defense, parks). These goods have two key traits: one person's use does not prevent others' use and no one can be denied access whether or not they pay (Netzer 1978). Hence, selection standards and pricing cannot restrict use and consumption is mandatory for some (e.g., sewage systems) (Hinrichs and Taylor 1972).

Public Scrutiny

Because they receive subsidies, tax-exempt status, tax funding and provide public goods and services, the public and the press frequently scrutinize PNPs (Lovelock and Weinberg 1978). Scrutiny is especially strong for Ps where formal (legal) and informal (political) influences provide oversight and ensure public accountability (Rainey, Backoff and Levine 1976). Compared to FPs, there are higher expectations for behavior of officials and administrators (Caiden 1971).³

Market Exposure

PNPs and FPs differ in exposure to economic marketplace pressures. Although there is variation across PNPs, many have little market exposure since they sell few products or services. Indeed, in the U.S., NPs' actions are limited as sales revenues can jeopardize tax-exempt status (Rados 1981).⁴ Ps avoid market exposure by raising taxes. Key resources like donations, votes and volunteers are received through non-market exchanges.

²Kotler and Zaltman (1971) label the marketing of ideas and causes, "social marketing."

³Note, for example, the 1989 publicity on ethics violations in the U.S. House of Representatives, and the resignation of Speaker Wright.

⁴PNPs engaged in FP activities face market exposure, as do PNPs like colleges and hospitals that are highly dependent on revenues from students/patients.

Competition

PNPs are frequently reluctant to openly compete with organizations offering similar services, preferring collaborative relationships. However, in some areas there is fierce competition; among colleges for students and between pro-life and pro-choice groups on abortion. Also, recent U.S. tax law changes have increased competition for funding. Nonetheless, frequently cooperation is the rule, at least in part because PNPs believe they and other organizations are attempting to achieve similar missions (Kotler and Andreasen 1987). Employees may be more committed to the profession than the PNP; the organization is thus less important than the service it provides.

TYPOLGY OF RESEARCH

Here we present a brief typology of research, exemplified by PNP literature. Our purpose is to lay the groundwork for examining extant research in PNP marketing and identifying areas for future research effort. The typology is roughly ordered from theoretical to empirical research:

Philosophy examines untestable propositions. Attention has focused on whether marketing ideas and concepts apply to PNPs (Luck 1969) and what is marketing (Capon and Mauser 1982)?

Theory building develops testable constructs and models. For example, Hudson and Brown (1983) develop a preventative health care model based on consumer socialization.

Normative research describes how marketing principles and methods apply to PNPs. For example Kotler and Zaltman (1971) show the importance of the 4Ps for effective social marketing.

Descriptive research portrays marketing situations faced by, or marketing actions taken by, PNPs. Research may be narrow (case study), or involve many PNPs (survey research). Examples include population control efforts aided by marketing research, distribution and promotion (Farley and Leavitt 1971) and a case study on marketing for student admissions (Lynch 1978).

Reviews contribute by assembling and discussing previous work and, frequently, charting future directions. For example, Wortzel (1976) reviews research on consumer health care behavior.

Methodological research is "controlled investigation of . . . measurement, mathematics and statistics, and ways of obtaining and analyzing data" (Kerlinger 1973: p. 703). Studies include Lovelock (1976), who makes rec-

ommendations on sample design, data collection and measurement techniques for urban transportation research.⁵

Testing relationships is "systematic, controlled, empirical and critical investigation of hypothetical propositions about presumed relations among natural phenomenon" (Kerlinger 1973: p. 11). For example, Miller and Zikmund (1979) test a model of health care choice.

PROCEDURE

Because of space limitations, reviewers must be careful in setting boundaries for what to include and what to exclude. If a review is complete within a defined scope, readers have confidence regarding what is included and guidance on where to seek for additional sources.

Our mission is to set the stage for further PNP marketing research. Our search included major academic marketing and strategy journals, and published national conference proceedings. We identified 293 articles but doubtless excluded some relevant work. We reviewed one research volume but not books, book chapters, nor journals focused on specific PNP "industries" (e.g., *Studies in Family Planning*, *Journal of Higher Education*, *Transportation Research*).

We collected all relevant articles published from 1969 to 1987 in six marketing journals: *European Journal of Marketing*, *Journal of Consumer Research*, *Journal of Marketing*, *Journal of Marketing Research*, *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science* and *Marketing Science*. We searched proceedings of the Association for Consumer Research's annual conference and the American Marketing Association's summer marketing educators and services marketing conferences. We collected articles from six journals in the strategy area: *Academy of Management Journal*, *Administrative Science Quarterly*, *Journal of Business Strategy*, *Management Science*, *Sloan Management Review*, and *Strategic Management Journal*. We searched three PNP-related marketing journals: *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, *Journal of Macromarketing*, and *Journal of Public Policy and Marketing*. We also reviewed *Advances in NonProfit Marketing*.⁶

Each article concerns marketing or strategy and a PNP or its offering(s). Papers on operations, tactical or short-term strategies and management in general are excluded; also those not specifically pertaining to PNPs (e.g., marketing prescription drugs or solely services marketing).

⁵Application of existing methodologies to PNPs are not considered methodological research but are classified as either normative or descriptive.

⁶Space limitations forced us to exclude some articles from this review. A complete reference list, including several books, is available from the authors.

We organize the articles into six topics: corporate strategy; marketing management; product management and price; communications and distribution; voter, donor and consumer behavior; and market segmentation. We divide some topics into sub-topics and add one specific PNP topic: whether and how marketing principles and concepts help PNPs. We also categorize each article by research type using the research typology developed above (Table 1).

LEVEL OF RESEARCH EFFORT

The state of PNP marketing research gives some cause for concern. Although 293 articles is substantial, the annual average is only 15. Publications increase after 1976 (Table 2), confirming Lovelock and Weinberg's (1978) assertion that "PNP marketing has come of age." But growth in PNP research has ceased; publications in 1976–1981 and 1982–1987 are roughly equivalent.⁷

The source of publications is also disturbing as PNP marketing gains legitimacy from articles in major journals. *Journal of Marketing Research* and *Marketing Science* publish little PNP research; publication in *Journal of Marketing* is declining. *Journal of Consumer Research* (1.5 articles per year) is a consistent outlet for PNP research as is *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science* (2 articles per year), but publications in AMA and ACR proceedings are falling. Positively, *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, launched in the early 1980s, contributes 11% of articles.

Most research effort is on voter, donor and consumer behavior; how marketing helps PNPs; and communications and distribution. Few articles concern marketing management (Table 3).

Table 1
GUIDELINES FOR CLASSIFYING ARTICLES

Research type	Guideline
1. Philosophy	Discusses why/why not apply marketing to PNPs or what is marketing?
2. Theory building	Presents models or testable constructs, without testing.
3. Normative	Discusses how to apply marketing to PNPs.
4. Descriptive	Describes existing organization(s) e.g., a case, or describes application of marketing strategy.
5. Review	Summarizes previous research.
6. Methodological	Investigates data collection or analysis, measurement, or statistics focused on PNPs.
7. Testing relationships	Tests hypothetical propositions.

⁷Of course, all these comments refer to the set of journals searched.

Table 2
DISTRIBUTION OF ARTICLES BY OUTLET OVER TIME

Outlet	Time period			Total
	1969-1975	1976-1981	1982-1987	
Academy of Management Journal	1			1
Administrative Science Quarterly				1
Advances in Consumer Research ^a	7	29	10	46
Advances in Nonprofit Marketing			15	15
AMA Educators Proceedings ^b	18	53	19	90
European Journal of Marketing		3	12	15
Journal of Academy of Marketing Science	3	12	8	23
Journal of Business Strategy				0
Journal of Consumer Research	1	10	7	18
Journal of Health Care Marketing			33	33
Journal of Macromarketing			6	6
Journal of Marketing	9	7	4	20
Journal of Marketing Research	2	3	1	6
Journal of Public Policy and Marketing			4	4
Management Science	4	3		7
Marketing Science				4
Sloan Management Review			4	4
Strategic Management Journal			1	1
Total	45	120	128	293

^aProceedings of the annual conference of the Association for Consumer Research

^bProceedings of the summer marketing educators conference and of the marketing services conference (1981, 1985) of the American Marketing Association.

The most common research type is descriptive, nearly 40% of articles. Happily, the second most common is testing relationships, but there are few reviews and even fewer methodological pieces. Only 14% of papers are theory—untested propositions (tested propositions are coded as testing relationships). The large number (nearly one-fifth) of normative papers (how PNPs should use marketing) is not surprising given PNP marketing's development from FP marketing.

REVIEW OF RESEARCH

In this section, we critically review PNP marketing research. The review is organized by research topic, rather than by PNP/FP marketing differences, to improve integration of findings. However, integration was quite difficult since the topic is so large and studies scattered. We evaluate research in four areas: robust findings, sound methodology, concern for issues differentiating PNP and FP marketing, and range of research types across research topic. Following this review, we return to PNP/FP differences to offer directions for future research.

Table 3
SUMMARY OF ARTICLES ON PUBLIC/NONPROFIT MARKETING BY RESEARCH TOPIC AND TYPE

Research topic	Research type ^a							Testing relationships	Total ^b
	Philosophy	Theory	Normative	Descriptive	Review	Methodology			
Corporate strategy	0	3% (8)	4% (11)	4% (12)	0	0	1% (2)	11% (31)	
Marketing management	0	3% (1)	1% (3)	3% (9)	0	0	0	4% (12)	
Product management & price	0	3% (8)	1% (3)	5% (15)	.3% (1)	0	4% (11)	12% (36)	
Communications & distribution	.3% (1)	1% (4)	4% (11)	4% (12)	1% (4)	0	8% (24)	18% (54)	
Voter, donor & consumer behavior	.3% (1)	4% (13)	0	8% (22)	2% (6)	.1% (1)	10% (30)	25% (72)	
Segmentation	0	0	1% (4)	6% (17)	3% (1)	.3% (1)	1% (2)	8% (23)	
Whether/how marketing can help PNPs	5% (15)	2% (5)	7% (21)	8% (22)	1% (4)	0	.3% (1)	21% (61)	
Other	1% (3)	3% (1)	1% (4)	2% (5)	0	1% (2)	1% (2)	5% (16)	
Total ^b	7% (20)	14% (40)	19% (57)	39% (114)	6% (16)	1% (4)	25% (72)		

^aPercentage of total number of articles (293). Number in parentheses represents articles in this research category.

^bEntries do not sum to 100%, because some articles belong in multiple categories.

Papers include models of strategic planning, analytic tools for planning, and descriptions of how PNPs plan and the strategies they use.

Models. Two general NP planning models maintain that identifying goals prior to strategic planning is too difficult. Hatten (1982) reverses conventional strategic planning by advocating that NPs first develop functional strategies, then sum to identify corporate strategy. Nutt's (1984) model requires that NPs first state expectations for quality, acceptance and/or innovation; he combines these dimensions to form archetypes and specifies planning methods for each.

Several models focus on specific PNP types. Mathews and Blackwell (1980) recommend universities adopt a marketing orientation and classic strategic planning. Montanari and Bracker's (1986) strategic management process for state government agencies is based on FPs but includes several unique PNP aspects. Ferrell, Madden and Legg (1986) develop a similar process for non-profit health-care organizations; they argue that these NPs should design strategies that build and maintain vocal and responsive community advocacy groups.

Planning tools. Several papers apply FP strategic planning experience to health care. Wood and Singh (1986) adapt the Boston Consulting Group portfolio by using profitability (actual expense versus allowed Medicare expense) and efficiency (actual length of stay compared to Medicare standard) as key matrix dimensions. Zallocco, Joseph and Doremus (1984) illustrate use of the GE/McKinsey Business Screen; they argue for its appropriateness for PNP hospitals since these can customize criteria for market attractiveness and organization strength. In competitively-oriented papers, Busch and Farrell (1981) show how hospitals can estimate market share and Salvatore (1984) adapts FP-based competitor analysis. Massey and Blake (1987) estimate market boundaries using physician referral, services assortment and availability; their approach assumes choice determinants are adequately estimated, but they do not use those most important for health care (See Product Management, below). Finally, Hawes and Rao (1985) discuss generating marketing strategies using importance-performance analysis.

Tools for specific strategic planning steps include forecasting a university's market potential by determining the match with individual market segments, then assessing segment measurability, substantiality, accessibility and durability (Fox and Ihlanfeldt 1980). Anderson and Klippel (1976) propose evaluating public policy decisions by using a cost/benefit approach oriented to consumers' perspectives. Both tools fit models recommended above. Hamelman (1970) suggests universities define mission by setting priorities among goals, view departments and schools as a matrix (since students take courses

in several areas) and use systems approaches. Hardy (1981) describes business analysis and reevaluation and restatement of objectives for U.K. theaters.

Planning and strategy in use. Descriptive studies of planning include Ps (e.g., Murphy (1984) on the FTC). In colleges, the president's office or a planning support unit write most strategic plans (Allen and Peters 1983). There is initial support that a university unit's centrality (closeness of purposes to the university) and institutional power (relative influence) directly affect allocated resources (Hackman 1985). Environmental power (ability to bring in critical outside resources) and resource negotiation strategies interact with centrality to affect received resources.

Several papers present specific strategies, such as Tuckman and Chang (1986) on hospitals. Norris (1985) reviews collaborations between PNPs and FPs; for example, the National Cancer Center and Kellogg worked to substantiate advertising claims for All-Bran cereal. Despite positive results, image problems could arise; for FPs by negative association with PNP causes (e.g., cancer), for PNPs by association with commercial companies.⁸

Nielsen (1986) defines a new strategy, "piggybacking;" PNPs diversify by acquiring or developing businesses whose purpose is to generate revenue and subsidize missions. He describes several successful piggybacking strategies but notes the dangers of monetary losses and negative images with donors and other publics. Fine (1987) discusses a similar phenomenon in which PNPs "unbundle" profit-making ventures (e.g., Planned Parenthood's sale of branded condoms), but estimates only 10–15% are successful.

Summary. The 11 normative strategy papers (35%) represent the most common research type; this is not surprising given development of PNP strategic planning from FPs. The 12 descriptive papers (39%) provide some understanding of how PNPs plan. It is encouraging that eight papers (26%) develop theory; unfortunately only two papers test relationships.

Taken as a group, these papers reveal considerable progress on methods of long range or strategic planning, especially as regards overall models and use of specific analytic tools. Many methods were developed for specific types of PNP but their potential is more widespread. There is insufficient research on how PNPs actually plan, on strategies they employ or on development of PNP-specific strategies. As in FP strategy, future work should include implementation.

⁸Note that Consumer's Union refuses to allow the use of its name in advertising.

These articles concern PNP's marketing orientation; a subset examines the degree to which PNP managers have adopted marketing principles.

In the U.S., managers in dance companies (Legum and George 1981), museums (Allen, Schewe and Weber 1981), public recreation areas and parks (Lamb and Crompton 1981) and hospitals (e.g., McDevitt and Shields 1985) show positive response to the marketing concept, but do not use it fully. For example, dance companies are reluctant to allow audience tastes to overrule artistic judgments and to use audience input for deciding ticket prices (Legum and George 1981). Both the dance and museum studies use national samples, suggesting generalizable results; but other studies are restricted to one region (Lamb and Crompton 1981; McDevitt and Shields 1985).

Yorke (1984) suggests that U.K. PNPs trail the U.S. in adopting marketing; he believes there is no coordinated approach and no coherent body of literature. Western Europe is similar (Yorke and Jones 1984). Although some surveys by U.K. museums have helped the sponsors, museum managers have neither accepted the marketing philosophy nor professional market research standards (Yorke and Jones 1984). Standards of user surveys are also low for U.K. libraries, but there is some acceptance of a marketing orientation (Cronin 1984).

The remaining work includes two normative papers using general approaches. One diagnoses a hospital's culture to measure acceptance of the marketing concept (Arnold, Capella and Sumrall 1987a); a second develops procedures for changing cultural values to embrace marketing (Arnold, Capella and Sumrall 1987b). A more detailed program provides a marketing orientation for health service personnel (George and Crompton 1985). Although these three papers focus on health care, the approaches may be useful for other PNPs.

Summary. This small set of papers, mostly descriptive (9 papers—75%), adds to our knowledge of marketing in PNPs, but none is sufficiently explicit regarding PNP/FP differences. Descriptive studies are most common; none test relationships nor develop theory. Although most samples are restricted, similarity of results across studies suggests robustness; however, since the typical methodology is a survey requesting agreement with various statements, demand effects cannot be ruled out. The empirical findings are all ten years old; they could be expanded to Ps and updated. Also, theory development is needed; for example, what degree of marketing orientation is appropriate, what are determining factors?

Product Management and Price (36)

This section concerns product strategy and price; price typically appears as a product characteristic. The majority of papers focus on attributes or features; fewer concern new products.

Attributes/features. This section (summarized in Table 4) reviews both subjective perceptual attributes that consumers use to choose or evaluate alternatives and objectively-defined features, typically controllable by managers (Neslin 1983). Quality is a common attribute; price/value is important

Table 4
RESEARCH ON IMPORTANT ATTRIBUTES FOR PNP OFFERINGS

<i>Colleges & Universities:</i>		
<i>Attribute¹</i>	<i>Specific feature or attribute(s) studied</i>	
Quality	Academic quality	(MacLachlan & Leister 1974)
	Quality rankings by deans	(Punj & Staelin 1978)
	Reputation, faculty quality, etc.	(Vaughn, Pitlick & Hansotia 1978)
	Job potential, national reputation	(Houston 1980)
	Reputation	(Krone, Gilly, Zeithaml & Lamb 1981)
	High prestige-low prestige	(Traynor 1981)
	Quality education	(Hampton 1983)
Cost	Faculty teaching, academic excellence	(Hawes & Glisan 1983)
	Tuition costs and financial aid	(Houston 1980)
	Tuition, living costs	(Krone, Gilly, Zeithaml & Lamb 1981)
	Tuition costs and financial aid	(Vaughn, Pitlick & Hansotia 1978)
	Tuition plus living costs, fellowships, loans	(Punj & Staelin 1978)
	Expensive-inexpensive	(Traynor 1981)
	Instate location, distance from student's home	(Punj & Staelin 1978)
Location	Location	(Vaughn, Pitlick & Hansotia, 1978)
	Geographic location, already live/work in area	(Krone et al 1981)
	Urban-nonurban	(Traynor 1981)
Personalness/	Personal interest, individual help	(Vaughn, Pitlick & Hansotia 1978)
	Low student/faculty ratio	(Krone et al 1981)
Attention	Faculty orientation towards students	(Hampton 1983)
	Faculty concern, faculty/student interaction	(Hawes & Glisan 1983)
Size	Size	(MacLachlan & Leister 1974)
	Size of entering class	(Punj & Staelin 1978)
	Number of students, campus size	(Vaughn, Pitlick & Hansotia 1978)
	Size	(Houston 1980)
	Small-large	(Traynor 1981)
<i>Health care:</i>		
<i>Attribute²</i>	<i>Specific feature or attribute(s) studied</i>	
Quality	Physician prestige	(Maholtra 1983)
	Doctor selection, location, dental care, hours	(Neslin 1983)
Value	Hospital price	(Maholtra 1983)
	Clinic price	(Newman 1984)
Convenience	Proximity to hospital	(Maholtra 1983)
	Waiting time, location	(Newman 1984)
	Location, hours, dental care	(Neslin 1983)
Personalness	Consistency of personalized care	(Clarke 1979)
	Doctor selection, hours, location	(Neslin 1983)

¹This list represents the authors' interpretation.

²This list is from Neslin (1983).

Table 4 (Continued)
RESEARCH ON IMPORTANT ATTRIBUTES FOR PNP OFFERINGS

<i>Performing arts:</i>		
<i>Attribute¹</i>	<i>Specific feature or attribute(s) studied</i>	<i>Effect on attendance</i>
Quality:	Famous performers (Belk & Andreasen 1980) ²	Positive
	Renown of performers (Currim, Weinberg & Wittink 1981) ²	Positive
	Popular operas (Havlena & Holak 1988)	Positive
	Premieres (Havlena & Holak 1988)	Positive
Price:	Price discounts (Belk & Andreasen 1980) ²	None
	Subscriber price discounts (Ryans & Weinberg 1978) ²	Less
		important
Convenience:	Shorter driving times (Currim, Weinberg & Wittink 1981) ²	Positive
	Day of the week (Weinberg 1986; Havlena & Holak 1988)	Varied
	Convenient location (Belk & Andreasen 1980) ²	None
Other:	Subtitles (Havlena & Holak 1988)	Positive
	Season (Weinberg & Shachmut 1978)	Varied
	Type of performance (Weinberg & Shachmut 1978, Weinberg 1986)	Varied
	Subscriber seating priority (Ryans & Weinberg 1978) ²	More
		important
	Number events in subscription (Currim, Weinberg & Wittink 1981) ²	Less important
	Variety in subscription (Havlena & Holak 1988)	None
<i>Mass transit:</i>		
<i>Attribute¹</i>	<i>Specific feature or attribute(s) studied</i>	
Quality/	Total travel time ³ (Golden, Betak & Alpert 1979)	
Performance	Excess ride time, ⁴ waiting time, ⁴ walking time to transit stop ⁴ (Umesh 1987)	
Price	Cost/mile ⁴ (Golden, Betak & Alpert 1979)	
	Price ³ (Umesh 1987)	
Convenience	Days per week available, ⁴ hours per day available ⁴ (Golden, Betak & Alpert 1979)	
Safety	Possibility of encountering a dangerous person ³ (Golden, Betak & Alpert 1979)	
Environmental effect	Energy use per passenger, ³ pollution per passenger ³ (Golden, Betak & Alpert 1979)	

¹This list represents the authors' interpretation.

²These studies survey intentions; it is best to interpret the features in terms of relative (not absolute) importance/unimportance.

³This feature was among the most important features in this study.

⁴This feature was among the second most important features in this study.

in all areas except performing arts, perhaps because arts consumers have above median incomes. For PNPs with a short time for service delivery (e.g., hospitals, arts, mass transit), convenience is important. It is less important where service delivery time is long, so preferred locations for universities include out-of-state or over 1000 miles from home (Punj and Staelin 1978). Personalness is key for high customer contact PNPs (e.g., universities, health care) but not for those with low customer contact (e.g., performing arts, mass transit).

Generalizability of results on colleges and performing arts is good due to moderately sized samples and consistent results across studies. Many college studies simply collect importance ratings of attributes and do not test for significance. Exceptions are Traynor's (1981) discriminant analysis and Punj and Staelin's (1978) regression analysis; all performing arts studies test for significance. Only Belk and Andreasen (1980) consider the problem of

broadening arts audiences, but use a strict goal: attract more non-attenders than attenders and do not dissuade attenders. Health care studies are less robust; samples are small (Maholtra 1983), non-probabilistic (Neslin 1983) or both (Newman 1984). Only Clarke (1979) uses a large sample. Mass transit papers are sounder, using a large sample (Umesh 1987) or a small but random one (Golden, Betak and Alpert 1979).

New products. Limited data suggest that PNPs do not follow the classic FP new product development process. Bowers (1987) concludes that the market does not drive new service development in hospitals and that prototype and market testing are uncommon. His findings support Stutts and Low's (1981) suggestions regarding health care product failure.

Kovach (1978) focuses on identifying new product ideas, using the unique aspects of a zoo to make general conclusions about new product development. Parameswaran, Goldstucker and Greenberg (1978) describe a Delphi survey methodology for generating new product ideas.

Chow, Hutchins and Sikorski (1974) suggest three changes for improving introduction of innovations to schools: greater understanding of school characteristics affecting adoption, listing attributes of educational innovations and diffusion strategies for initiation/implementation. Stiff and Kaufman (1975) note that new product adoption may solely affect adopters or have contiguous effects—across generations, across pairs of people, across individuals through a chain process or across segments of society through ecological effects. They argue that compliance strategies (i.e., rewards and punishments to achieve adoption) may be appropriate for high-contiguous innovations (e.g., children may attend school only after vaccinations which affect other individuals).

Summary. This section includes 15 descriptive papers (42%) and 11 (31%) testing relationships. The empirical emphasis is encouraging but greater attention to statistical inference would be desirable. Papers on attributes are generally sound methodologically, except those in health care which are best treated as pilot studies.

Findings on attributes are most robust for quality and cost; fewer studies concern other attributes. All pricing studies use intention to purchase; research using actual behavior would generate more robust findings, as would more experiments. For new products, closer attention to consumer response, competitive activity and unique aspects of PNPs would improve the development process. To improve market introduction, contiguous effects and interactions between user characteristics, innovation attributes and generic diffusion strategies should be considered.

All articles concern PNP services, mostly focusing on specific attributes; a few papers, mostly in performing arts, focus on other PNP/FP differences (e.g., non-financial goals). None examine other offerings (e.g., ideas, causes, values, persons, places); more work is needed here.

Communications and Distribution (54)

This research focuses on communications and distribution for PNP offerings.

Communications. Two studies demonstrate the important role of personal selling in securing long-run behavioral commitment of young adults for college enrollment and Navy enlistment. College representative visits to high schools (Chapman and Franklin 1981) and number of Navy recruiters (Carroll, Rao, Lee, Shapiro and Bayus 1985) are positively related to enrollment/enlistment. The Navy study is a well-executed controlled experiment that tests multiple levels of recruiters and advertising, and includes competitive activity; the college results are less robust since a simplistic and incomplete econometric model is used.

Not surprisingly, advertising is less consistent in securing required long-run behavior for PNPs than personal selling. National advertising is not effective for U.S. Navy recruitment and local advertising is effective only for high school graduates; however, joint advertising with other armed forces' branches is effective (Carroll et al. 1985). Political advertisements aimed at voters recruit few new volunteers, but seem to have positive effects on current campaign workers (Sheinkopf, Atkin and Bowen 1972). This latter relationship is not well established because it relies on self reports, but the study is noteworthy for addressing multiple publics.

Robertson (1976) and Robertson and Wortzel (1978) focus on difficulties in changing health care behavior. They present strong evidence, based on several campaigns and a controlled field experiment, that mass media advertising is ineffective in changing health care behavior (e.g., seat belt use). Results are similar for energy conservation (Ritchie and McDougall 1985) and mass transit (Golden and Alpert 1978). Robinson (1979) shows that point-of-use information may be effective for mass transit. These results have implications for several PNP domains.

However, mass communication can create awareness, affect attitudes and beliefs, and reinforce existing behaviors; Bratic, Greenberg and Petersen (1981) and Freimuth (1985) identify execution elements for effective public service announcements (PSAs). In Bratic, Greenberg and Petersen's (1981) study, PSAs are cleverly embedded in a TV program but conclusions on executional excellence are based on small samples. Freimuth (1985) bases

suggestions for effectiveness on study of 58 PSAs, supplemented by a review of the marketing literature.

Message wording can be crucial. In advocating driving behavior that saves fuel, Dunbar and Steffire (1980) find that messages about range per tank per year are more appealing than those about cents or miles per gallon, or cents per mile.

Additional evidence on the positive effects of certain personal selling approaches concerns donations. Financial donations can be stimulated by personal appeals such as legitimization ("even-a-dollar will help") (e.g., Brockner et al., 1984), labeling (classifying donors by purported behavior) (e.g., Moore, Bearden and Teel 1985), and foot-in-the-door and door-in-the-face (Reingen 1978). However, these studies also show that direct requests and dependency (creating the perception in potential donors that beneficiaries are dependent on them) are less effective. Veteran blood donors are more likely to agree to donate if they believe the appointment is optional, that they have greater freedom to refuse, and that the blood bank is depending on them (Henion and Batsell 1976). Direct mail reminders to previous donors and door-in-the-face appeals to potential donors may increase blood donations (Murphy 1985). Intentions to volunteer for NPs are higher from subjects receiving a labeling appeal before direct mail than the reverse (Swinyard and Ray 1977). The stronger results use actual donations as dependent measures (Brockner et al. 1984; Murphy 1985; Reingen 1978) compared to intentions (Henion and Batsell 1976; Moore, Bearden and Teel 1985; Swinyard and Ray 1977).

As for advertising to donors; self- versus other-oriented advertisements are more effective in generating positive attitudes to kidney donation (Barnett et al. 1987); this result has implications for other donation types. Fortunately, the authors use an experimental approach; survey methodology might bias results in favor of altruism. In an experimental study where subjects examined high quality toys, Dyer, Kuehl and Williams (1974) find that a persuasive message plus information that a rehabilitation workshop produced the toys and an altruistic appeal is less effective (i.e., generates less positive attitudes and less willingness to pay high prices) than a persuasive message without the information and appeal. Fine (1987) argues that pity, an extreme altruistic appeal, has short-run success but offends some people.

Altruistic appeals are also ineffective for energy conservation. In a comprehensive review, Ritchie and McDougall (1985) argue that appeals to patriotism and social responsibility do not change behavior; the only effective appeal is cost saving. Rudelius, Weijs and Dodge (1984) concur and provide specific ways for Ps to implement such appeals.

Communications influence voting behavior. Promotional campaign expenditures positively impact voter participation (Chapman and Palda 1984; Palda 1973). A candidate's expenditures increase votes; rivals' expenditures

reduce votes (Chapman and Palda 1980). Incumbency does not affect the impact of promotional expenditures in Canadian elections (Chapman and Palda 1980), but incumbents' expenditures are effective in the U.S., especially for Democrats (Siomkos and Ghosh 1986). To make the best use of radio and TV advertising, Shosteck (1976) recommends candidates use the media preferences of target voters, rather than ratings. In other studies, Chapman and Palda (1980) find face-to-face communication generally attracts more votes than mass media. Swinyard and Coney (1978), supporting Rothschild (1978), show that both direct-mail advertising and personal canvassing have positive effects in low-involvement but not high-involvement elections. Laczniak and Caywood (1987) review the advantages and disadvantages of TV political advertising and argue that its effect on voter participation is unclear.

The effects of communications on voting behavior seem generally well supported. Most studies use voting behavior as the dependent variable; Swinyard and Coney (1978) do not, but rather conduct a field experiment.

Distribution. Two normative papers focus on Ps' distribution decisions (Lamb and Crompton 1985) and how logistics can help PNPs (Jones and Cooper 1981). Both studies demonstrate understanding of PNP objectives and offerings. Crompton and Lamb (1983) discuss concepts of equity in Ps' distribution decisions; they urge administrators carefully to select and specify the concept used. Revelle, Marks and Liebman (1970) review location-allocation models for Ps; they recognize that Ps have multiple publics and so incorporate both supplier and user costs.

Three papers focus on vertical relationships. As wholesalers or retailers for privately-produced goods, PNPs resemble FPs but have more diffuse goals and more constrained retailing methods (Hollander 1981). Fox (1981) focuses on the intermediary role of public schools in distributing goods and services for both Ps and FPs. To achieve their goals, she argues that schools should use their power of access to children to set limits and negotiate. Andreasen (1981) develops three strategies open to PNPs to secure assistance from intermediaries in achieving goals (e.g., the National Cancer Institute asks doctors to encourage patients to stop smoking).

Summary. The methodologies used in these papers are encouraging; 24 papers (44%) test relationships. There are 11 normative (20%) and 12 descriptive (22%) papers. However, there are no methodological papers and few that present untested theory. As regards topics, communications receives far more attention than distribution.

Most studies are methodologically sound. Although distribution studies explicitly consider PNPs' unique characteristics, many on communications

do not. For example, Carroll et al.'s (1985) Navy study is well done but does not recognize Navy enlistment as a special PNP offering.

In summary, communications can affect demand for PNP offerings. Personal selling (including personal appeals and face-to-face contact) has more effect on behavior than media advertising, especially for long-term behavior change. Overall, these conclusions are robust.

Although PNPs can make distribution or logistic decisions in many ways, goals are consistently important. In general, authors suggest PNPs use more structured or deliberate processes to make such decisions. However, no paper demonstrates distribution effects.

Voter, Donor, Consumer Behavior (71)

Research focuses on the most important of PNPs' multiple publics: voters, donors, volunteers, and consumers and uses.

Voters. Research on voter behavior focuses on demographics and other consumer characteristics affecting voting. Chapman and Palda (1983) show that in Canadian provincial elections, income, female workforce participation and unemployment rate have negative effects on votes cast; education and closeness of the race have positive effects. The authors adduce support for a rational voter model (e.g., citizens with higher incomes are less likely to vote because of higher opportunity costs), but their conclusion seems weak as they predict both positive and negative effects on voting for three variables.

As regards voter choice, variables other than demographics are useful. Newman and Sheth (1985) show that in a U.S. presidential primary election, issues, policies and social groups supporting candidates predict candidate choice better than both standard demographics or political demographics (e.g., own or parents' party affiliation). In a study of voting for an issue (i.e., bottle ban), Crosby and Taylor (1983) shows that social motivation leads to greater stability of choice for high commitment voters.

Level of involvement also affects voting. U.S. local elections are less involving than higher level elections (e.g., presidential) (Rothschild and Houston 1980). Low involvement explains why simple clues (non-female name, endorsement from newspaper or association) gain candidates votes (Nakanishi, Cooper and Kassarian 1974). Furthermore, consistent with a low involvement hierarchy of effects (behavior affects attitude), a greater proportion of subjects labeled as more likely to vote do indeed vote, compared to both a group labelled as similar to the average citizen and to a control group (Yalch 1975). Conversely, in a high involvement U.S. presidential election, Nimmo (1975) finds candidate choice is more related to

attitudes than to issues or to liberal/conservative learning; his results are robust as he uses a national probability sample.

The voting behavior studies have good dependent variables; all use actual voting behavior rather than attitudes or intentions. However, results have limited generalizability as studies are mostly based on single elections and in some cases sample sizes are small (i.e., Rothschild and Houston 1980; Yalch 1975). The exception is Chapman and Palda (1983) who base conclusions on results from elections in 10 different provinces.

Donors. Research on donating includes models of giving that apply to any type of resource. Smith (1980) bases his framework on three progressive motivational processes assumed to underlie donating. Ryans and Weinberg (1978) test three similar steps (no involvement, some involvement, fully involved) in a study of financial gifts to a repertory theater, but these results do not support Smith's model. They find that subscribers with no previous relationship to the theater are a sizeable segment and that new subscribers are as likely to contribute (i.e., be fully involved) as existing subscribers. Sojka (1986) develops a more successful alternative model based on altruistic versus hedonic motivations to classify donors; her model is better grounded in the literature and develops, but does not test, several hypotheses.⁹ Kelly (1987) concentrates on museum donors and proposes motivations similar to Sojka (1986).

Rosenblatt, Cusson and McGown's (1986) model of donating to health causes uses severity (seriousness of the cause), involvement (risk of being infected), predominance (visibility), and alleviation (possibility of alleviating the condition). These four characteristics are good predictors of importance (perceived necessity to contribute) which, in turn, is a good predictor of financial donations. Unfortunately, the test is not rigorous; the sample is small and convenience, and the dependent variable is a forced hypothetical donation. Nonetheless, the model could also apply to time donations (i.e., volunteering).

In a study of financial donations to United Way, Adams and Lonial (1984) find that last year's contribution, general opinion of United Way and respondent's management status are the most useful variables to classify donors.

The relationship between blood donations and sex is unclear. Murphy (1985) asserts the mix of women and men is now roughly equal. However, studies of blood donors (Burnett 1981; Burnett and Leigh 1986; Smead and Burnett 1980) show they are more likely to be men. Studies on willingness to donate

⁹This paper also provides a good review of the gift-giving literature.

find no difference between the sexes (Pessemier, Bemmaor and Hanssens 1977; Wilms et al. 1986). Blood donors and more frequent donors are more likely to have rare blood types and lower self-esteem, but do not reveal a consistent pattern for marital status and risk taking (Burnett 1981; Burnett and Leigh 1986). More frequent donors and active donors (i.e., within the last year) are more socially concerned (Burnett and Leigh 1986; Smead and Burnett 1980). Despite differences in sample size (i.e., 161 in Smead and Burnett 1980; over 500 in Burnett 1981) the similarity of findings (except for sex) suggests robustness. Classifying blood donors by frequency is particularly useful (Burnett and Leigh 1986).

Research on donation of body parts includes skin and internal organs. Organ donation papers study only willingness to donate but again demographic findings conflict. Pessemier, Bemmaor and Hanssens (1977) find that women are more likely to be willing to donate kidneys than men, whereas Wilms et al. (1987) find no differences. However, whereas Wilms et al. (1987) study college students, Pessemier, Bemmaor and Hanssens (1977) sample a much broader age range. Since younger people are more likely to be willing to donate organs (Pessemier, Bemmaor and Hanssens 1977), sex differences may not appear in studies of college students. There is some evidence that higher income and education are positively related to a willingness to donate organs after death (Pessemier, Bemmaor and Hanssens 1977).

Psychographics and attitudes are also correlated with organ donation. Compared to students unwilling to donate, those willing to donate an organ view that organ as less sacred, emotional and mysterious, and more understandable (Wilms et al. 1987). McIntyre et al. (1987) find that willing versus unwilling donors differ more on reasons not to donate than on reasons to donate. For example, "willings" are less concerned about disfiguring the body after death and keeping it intact. Pessemier, Bemmaor and Hanssens (1977) confirm the negative effect of concern for the cadaver and find that charitable feelings are positively related to willingness to donate organs. However, the samples in these studies limit the generalizability of the findings. Although young adults are good candidates for organ donation, in the U.S., next of kin must give consent before organ removal after death, even if the potential donor has signed a donor card. Thus, students in McIntyre et al. (1987) and Wilms et al. (1987) are unlikely to be the ones to give consent. Furthermore, although the Pessemier, Bemmaor and Hanssens (1977) sample has a wide age range, it overrepresents demographic groups most likely to donate (due to nonresponse).

Volunteers. Yavas and Reicken (1981) find that men most favorable to volunteering are demographically similar to current volunteers. Kelly (1987), focusing on motivations, proposes two types of museum volunteer: traditional volunteers who like being at the museum and who feel obligated to

use their talents, and new volunteers who help because they believe people like themselves do so. Both types seek social status from the museum.

Consumers and users: Choice. Much research focuses on consumer choice and satisfaction. Fewer papers concern attitudes, information sources or decision processes. Transportation mode choice has attracted a good deal of interest. Barff, Mackay and Olshavsky (1982) review 34 travel-mode choice models and focus on model formation, data sources and included variables. They note that automobile availability, income and geographic location are major determinants of mode choice, but that other demographic variables are most useful for segmentation. These models, published mainly in the transportation literature, concentrate on system attributes and demographics. In contrast, marketing researchers emphasize behavioral factors (Feldman 1973) and psychographics (Lovelock 1975). Similarly, Tybout, Hauser and Koppleman (1978) focus on user perceptions; they find that perceptions of transportation alternatives determine preference which, together with feelings towards each mode, predicts choice. Neslin (1983) confirms the perception-preference link, but for health care.

Lovelock (1976) makes a strong and unusual contribution by suggesting methodological improvements in sample design, data collection and measurement techniques to test transportation choice models. Brown and Schary (1977) argue that transportation planning is often biased by sample design; basing results on a sample of 2400, they find citizens willing to provide input include too many seeking alternatives to automobiles and too few elderly.

In the cultural arena, Woods (1987) identifies a large set of motivations for arts consumption including four aesthetic motivations—stimulation, relaxation, escape and spiritual uplift. Holbrook and Zirlin (1985) define aesthetic appreciation as an experience enjoyed solely for its own sake, without utilitarian purpose; they suggest such experiences range between hedonic (pleasure or enjoyment) and profound (a strongly emotional self-transcendent response). Semenik (1987) cautions that further research on arts consumption requires breakthroughs in methodology to measure the hedonic and symbolic aspects of these offerings.

Early socialization seems critical to develop interest in the arts. Kelly (1987) emphasizes socialization in a theory of arts consumers and proposes two consumer types: Trads and Technos. Trads have inherent interest in the arts, acquired through socialization and education. Technos are also highly educated, though not in the arts or humanities; they seek status through the arts and want to acquire cultural objects as evidence of having an experience. Andreasen and Belk (1980) provide support for Kelly; they show that cultural patrons and socially actives, resembling Trads and Technos respectively, are the leisure lifestyles with highest attendance potential for theater and symphony. They also find that likelihood of attendance is positively

correlated with interest in the theater and symphony when growing up, as well as attendance last year. Bamossy's (1985) study of adolescents identifies two social structural variables, social class and gender, that influence arts-related experience; experience, in turn, affects judgments, intentions and arts patronage. Day (1985) confirms the effect of socialization and gender on live music preferences.

Socialization is also important for preventative health care. Hudson and Brown (1983) propose that social structural variables (e.g., religion, culture, family), life cycle position and previous socialization affect learning; learning in turn affects attitudes and behavior. Oliver and Burger (1979) confirm the importance of social influence; they show that normative influence, coupled with attribute evaluations, predicts flu shot behavior. Smith and Scammon (1987) find a similar result for the decision to exercise, although beliefs about advantages and disadvantages of exercising are more important than normative influence.

As in the arts, previous use is also a good predictor of health care behavior. Ortinau (1986) finds that a recent physical (within the past five years) and perceived importance of annual examinations are the best discriminators of annual physical exam users. Likewise, users of emergency medical services (EMS) are more likely to contact EMS (i.e., call an ambulance) in response to hypothetical medical emergencies (Sackmary 1985). In an Australian study, Barby and Wilkinson (1987) show that people emphasizing self-care versus visiting a doctor view the same symptoms as less serious.

Social influence is also important in college decisions. Spekman, Harvey and Bloom (1980) show that recommendations from parents and other authority figures significantly affect attitudes to attending college. Frisbie and Petrosious (1985) report professors and counselors are more important influences on choice of a marketing major than courses or skills. Other factors also influence college decisions. Career potential and opportunity for personal growth and achievement receive most emphasis in decisions to pursue MBAs; financial, emotional and time costs are less important (Krone et al. 1981). Unfortunately, the latter two papers rely on self-reported influences and neither reports significance; however, Krone et al. (1981) focuses on non-monetary costs.

Consumers and users: Satisfaction. This research focuses on PNP's whose users pay a fee for service. Ross et al.'s (1987) review concludes that expectations and subsequent experience interact to determine patient satisfaction, but the impact of disconfirmed expectations is not clear. A further health care study (Swan et al. 1985) and research on student satisfaction with test performance (Barry, Gilly and Schucany 1982) support these conclusions.

Satisfaction predicts repurchase. Dubinsky and Hensel (1982), based on a small but representative sample in a single city, find that nonrenewers to the Better Business Bureau may have financial or nonfinancial reasons. Firms with financial reasons for nonrenewal are more satisfied and more likely to rejoin at a later date. In a related college study, Hartley and Berkowitz (1983) find that members versus nonmembers of a university alumni association were somewhat more active as students and are currently more positive towards the school, suggesting greater satisfaction. Unfortunately, nonresponse from nonmembers and a sample restricted to recent alumni in the university's metropolitan area limits generalizability. Finally, Ortinau and Anderson (1986) develop a dynamic model for college students in which they treat satisfaction as a special type of attitude; however, they seem to overemphasize systematic and logical processes.

Summary. Of 71 behavioral papers, nearly three quarters are empirical; 29 (41%) test relationships, 22 (31%) are descriptive. The six reviews, like the single methodological piece, are particularly useful. Methodologies in voter studies are uniformly strong, but mixed otherwise. Papers on voters, donors and volunteers address PNP differences, most on consumers do not.

Results generally differ across publics. As Rothschild (1978) argues, involvement is useful for understanding voters; support for the rational model is weak. For volunteers and donors, hedonic versus altruistic motivations (Kelly 1987; Sojka 1985) offer most help. These conclusions are tentative for voters and donors; a more robust finding is the importance of normative influence on PNP consumers. Finally, satisfaction processes of PNP and FP consumers are similar.

Market Segmentation (23)

Segmentation research adds descriptive knowledge on consumers and donors and shows PNPs can usefully segment publics. We identified no voter or volunteer segmentation studies.

Arts organizations. Some studies on arts consumers use factor analysis of attendance data to identify groups of similar art forms (e.g., opera, symphony, other types of classical music, ballet in Nielsen, McQueen and Nielsen 1974). Others segment consumers of a single art form.

Several studies employ usage (i.e., attendance) as the segmentation basis and find differences on demographics. As noted elsewhere (Day 1985; Semenik 1987), arts consumers have higher incomes, education and job status; more frequent attenders are even more upscale. These relationships hold for museums (Robbins and Robbins 1981), opera (Semenik and Young 1979), theater (e.g., Nielsen, McQueen and Nielsen 1974), a group focused on

classical music and ballet (e.g., Nevin and Cavusgil 1981) and a group focused around modern music and dance (Nielsen, McQueen and Nielsen 1974). For classical performing arts, more frequent attendees are older as shown for theater and recitals (Nevin and Cavusgil 1981), opera (Semenik and Young 1979), a group of several performing arts (Sexton and Britney 1980), and a group focused on classical music and ballet (Nielsen, McQueen and Nielsen 1974). Not surprisingly, frequent country/folk music attendees are younger (Nevin and Cavusgil 1981). However, for museums, attendance segments do not differ by age (Robbins and Robbins 1981). The only gender differences appear for segments based on attendance at several art forms; opera specialists (attend opera most frequently) are more likely to be men; ballet specialists are more likely to be women (Sexton and Britney 1980). Finally, frequent arts consumers patronize more than one art form (Robbins and Robbins 1981; Semenik and Young 1979; Sexton and Britney 1980).

Social and aesthetic benefits are most important for arts consumers. Bamossy and Semenik (1981) and Steinberg, Miaoulis and Lloyd (1982) use benefit segmentation and identify three segments: one attends mainly for social reasons; a second, resembling Kelly's (1987) Trads, has inherent interest in the arts. Per Kelley's theory, the inherent interest segment had more exposure to the performing arts as children; they are also more frequent attenders of other performing arts (Bamossy and Semenik 1981). Steinberg, Miaoulis and Lloyd's (1982) third segment attends to gain status, similar to Kelly's (1987) Technos; Bamossy and Semenik's (1981) third segment attends to see a particular dancer or star and is the antithesis of the inherent interest segment.

Robbins and Robbins (1979) segment attendees at a King Tut exhibit on the basis of a user characteristic, social class. Segments do not differ on exposure to information about King Tut, but for lower social classes, radio and TV are more influential in the decision to attend; the higher classes attend the arts more frequently.

Smith and Beik (1982) argue that segments should have descriptors for identification, be sufficiently large to be viable targets, contain effective demand, respond to different marketing efforts and be accessible for communications. All articles meet the first criterion but not the other four. Most papers report percent of sample in each segment, but only Robbins and Robbins (1981) discuss whether segments are large enough. Robbins and Robbins (1981), Semenik and Young (1979), Sexton and Britney (1980) and Steinberg, Miaoulis and Lloyd (1982) each discuss the other three criteria; segments are accessible, but not necessarily via different media. The other articles either give information relevant to the criteria but fail to discuss them (Bamossy and Semenik 1981) or give no information (Nielsen, McQueen and Nielsen 1974; Nevin and Cavusgil 1981). In sum, articles that segment on attendance have the best support. Although all studies sample from a single city or region, similarity of findings across studies supports generalizability.

Health care. Articles on health care use several segmentation bases. Based on data from recent hospital patients, Finn and Lamb (1986) identify four benefit segments: physical comfort, psychological comfort, privacy plus quiet, and cognitive attributes (e.g., good administrative and medical procedures, amount of explanation received). These segments meet Smith and Beik's (1982) criteria but accessibility may be difficult.

Two studies segment health care consumers on user characteristics. Harrell and Fors (1985) use attitudes to identify segments of female health care consumers: family centered, sports oriented, wellness/wholeness, traditional and avoiders. The first three segments are self explanatory; traditional women do what they think should be done, avoiders minimize contact with health-care professionals. All segments except avoiders have viable demand; authors recognize the importance of segment size, responsiveness and accessibility but fail to discuss them. Bloch (1984) describes a single segment of wellness-seeking health consumers leading positive health lifestyles; it appears to meet Smith and Beik's (1982) criteria, except possibly accessibility.

Donors. Craig, Deutscher and McCann (1977) segment donors by donation type: religious, community and political giving. Beik and Smith (1979) form three segments of medical donors based on usage (i.e., donation size). Both studies show donors are older and somewhat upscale (but less so than arts consumers). Community and political givers are more involved in the community but these groups, along with religious donors, do not differ on psychographic variables (Craig, Deutscher and McCann 1977). Beik and Smith (1979) discuss all Smith and Beik's (1982) criteria, but Craig, Deutscher and McCann (1977) do not fully address any. Both studies employ large national samples, suggesting the findings are generalizable.

Summary. The majority of segmentation studies are descriptive (17 papers, 74%); only two test relationships and none develop theory. Most studies are methodologically sound, but few authors address criteria specifically or use them to direct efforts.

These studies employ several segmentation bases: usage (i.e., arts attendance, donation size) in six studies, benefits in four and consumer characteristics in three. Usage seems to be the most useful for PNP publics. Although many other bases are available (e.g., response elasticity), any that meet Smith and Beik's (1982) (or similar) criteria would be useful.

Most studies focus on consumers; few concern donors, none concern volunteers nor voters, and none focus on behavior change (e.g., wear seat belts). In addition to remedying these omissions, segmentation research should move beyond simply surveying consumers and donors. Rather, it should formulate and test theories of PNP segmentation; theory development should pay at-

tention to PNP/FP differences, as most studies to date ignore these differences.

Whether and How Marketing Can Help PNPs (60)

These papers either discuss whether marketing should encompass PNPs or describe how PNPs can use marketing.

PNP marketing: pro or con. Included are the classic papers that introduced PNP marketing (i.e., Kotler and Levy 1969a, 1969b; Kotler 1972). Others in favor of broadening marketing's domain are Enis (1973), Nickels (1972), Shama (1976) and Sheinkopf (1974). Other authors argue that marketing applies only to market exchanges (Luck 1969), economic goods (Arndt 1978) or market offerings (Morris 1982). Similar arguments, but later in time, concern U.K. PNPs. Some favor PNP marketing (e.g., Yorke 1984). Others are more negative; Foxall (1984) argues that empirical proof is needed on whether marketing can help local authority leisure services. Octon (1983) is also pessimistic; he argues that U.K. PNPs are more different from their FP counterparts than U.S. PNPs and FPs, but his examples are not convincing.

Other papers address problems, restrictions or conflicts that can arise in PNP marketing as the result of inherent PNP qualities. Lovelock and Weinberg (1974) show PNP/FP differences affecting marketing research and all marketing mix areas. Duhaime, McTavish and Ross (1985) identify factors that can expedite or inhibit social marketing. Furthermore, PNPs that create products for employee or member satisfaction are less likely to meet consumer needs. For example, Etgar and Ratchford (1974) note that the emphasis some universities place on research satisfies faculty and administrators, but not students; Litten (1981) makes no apology for limitations imposed by universities' dedication to create knowledge. Special aspects of state-owned firms (e.g., employee maintenance goals) also present barriers to marketing (Capon 1981).

Like Etgar and Ratchford (1974), Hirschman (1983) argues that full use of the marketing concept by ideologists and artists is impossible. An ideologist, for example, Mothers Against Drunk Driving (MADD), can hardly change its basic anti-alcohol premise to attract more members or followers. Likewise, artists must satisfy their own and peers' visions rather than offering what customers want. Holbrook and Zirlin (1985) assert that the key dimension of arts organizations is product versus customer orientation; NPs tend to be product oriented.

PNPs also face implementation problems. Managers who view marketing as inappropriate may raise barriers (e.g., university administrators and faculty, Berry and Kehoe 1980; hospital doctors and dentists, Clarke 1981).

Unrealistic expectations that marketing can save endangered PNPs may lead to disappointment and problems with further application—in hospitals (Clarke 1981), universities (Berry and Kehoe 1980) and PNPs in general (Murphy 1980).

In social marketing, implementation problems occur for market analysis, market segmentation, marketing mix strategies and evaluation (Bloom and Novelli 1981); this comprehensive discussion is applicable beyond social marketing. Berkowitz (1981) identifies several similar implementation problems in health-care marketing.

How marketing helps PNPs. These papers mostly embrace a more positive perspective. They include discussions of how marketing can help recruit blood donors (Murphy 1985); increase use of community mental health centers (Flaschner et al. 1977); and increase use of U.K. libraries (Coleman 1984). Schurr, Brown and Collins (1985) argue that governments should adopt marketing to better manage exchanges. Williams (1985) describes how cable television can solve some NP marketing problems; others recommend marketing research for Ps (e.g., Katona 1982) and higher education (Murphy 1979).

Kotler and Zaltman (1971) show how marketing analysis, planning and control can advance social causes. Positive examples of social marketing are found in Fox and Kotler's (1980) excellent review that covers all the issues noted here. Several case studies describe how marketing has helped PNPs: family planning (Farley and Leavitt 1971), a Welsh youth organization (Ford 1976) and the U.S. government's program to speed diffusion of solar energy (Krapfel 1980).

Summary. These papers are roughly equally split between three research types: normative (21)—focusing on how marketing can help PNPs and on problems in adopting marketing, philosophical (15)—on whether marketing should embrace PNPs, and descriptive (21)—including the many case studies. These papers clearly address PNP/FP differences and, for the time period reviewed, provide an appropriate methodological balance.

However, the question of whether marketing should apply to PNPs has ceased to be a controversy in the U.S. There have been sufficient case-like descriptions of marketing's successful application to PNPs. Future research should focus on problems of applying marketing in PNPs and on coping with and adjusting to these difficulties.

PUBLIC AND NONPROFIT MARKETING REVIEWS

As discussed in the Introduction, PNP marketing has been accepted as a legitimate field of study for several years. Ten years after Lovelock and

Weinberg (1978) pronounced PNP marketing had come of age, it seemed reasonable to review the PNP marketing literature. It also seemed reasonable to focus our search on the leading marketing journals and conference proceedings for, we thought, if a marketing subfield is to have legitimacy, it should pass the test of scrutiny by the field's review process.

However, we found relatively few PNP articles in major marketing journals and expanded the search to other outlets, ultimately reviewing almost 300 articles. Even so, the review is somewhat incomplete as we were unable to review all PNP marketing articles in domain specific outlets. More importantly, we believe there is a fundamental question of focus of the review itself.

In selecting PNP marketing to review, we implicitly divided the world into two parts: PNP marketing and FP marketing. Yet to review research on FP marketing seems ludicrous; the scope is so large that any review would be too superficial to advance the field.¹⁰ Rather, we expect reviews on different aspects of FP marketing; this, indeed is the purpose of this volume.

The issue for PNP marketing is similar. We reviewed PNP marketing research via the seven research topics (previous section), but the field is so large and encompasses so many areas that integration proved extremely difficult. The major difference versus FP marketing is that far less PNP marketing research appears in the leading journals. Indeed, it is the lack of research that allows us to review completely PNP marketing from the major journals, and not the fact that PNP marketing per se is a coherent body of research.

Nonetheless, we believe we have performed a service in bringing together in one place 20 years of PNP marketing research published in major journals, but we also believe this should be the last such effort. Future reviews should focus more narrowly; more focused search will include publication outlets beyond those we chose.

One obvious approach to organizing PNP marketing is to use an industry focus; however, this is not the most fruitful. Although there is some value in reviewing articles on health marketing, education marketing and so forth, we typically do not see comparable FP review articles on, for example, automobile marketing, steel marketing and the like.

We believe that for PNP marketing to make the most progress, reviews should focus on areas where PNPs are different from FPs; in addition, specific comparisons with FP marketing research would be of value. Furthermore, we believe that to advance PNP marketing specifically, and marketing

¹⁰We acknowledge the role of an anonymous reviewer in helping clarify this point.

in general, all PNP marketing research should pay explicit attention to PNP/FP differences and focus effort in these areas. We thus develop future research topics for PNP marketing by returning to the set of PNP/FP differences outlined in the first section of this review.

DIRECTIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH

In this section we explore future research directions for PNP marketing. We focus on two issues: type of research and topic of research.

Research Type

Fields of scientific endeavor progress most fruitfully when independent groups of researchers focus on specific research topics and empirically test theoretically-derived relationships. Unfortunately, we find no evidence of competitive research group efforts in PNP marketing (indeed there is little in marketing in general) as, for example today, in superconductivity or cold fusion research. Although empirical testing of theoretically-derived relationships is the second most numerous research type in our review, 71 articles in 20 years scarcely represents significant effort. Researchers like Chapman and Palda (voting behavior) and Weinberg and colleagues (product strategy) show the sustained effort that truly advances a field; many articles we identified are the authors' only PNP research! Clearly, there should be more effort in theory testing, but more particularly, programmatic effort on specific research topics is sorely needed.

In addition, there is little interaction between theory development and relationship testing research streams, despite presence of many testable but untested hypotheses and propositions in the literature (classified as theory). Effort in testing these theories, for example, Rothschild's (1979) hypotheses on communication effectiveness or Capon's (1981) propositions on differences between state- and privately-owned corporations, would be welcome.

As suggested above, we believe detailed literature reviews on subtopics are important in generating the sustained research effort needed to advance a field. First, a review brings together in one place the relevant literature; second, the author should set future research directions that assist other investigators in setting their own research agendas. We found relatively few reviews; two recent well-rounded examples are Semenik (1987) on arts marketing and Ross, Frommelt, Hazelwood and Chang (1987) on satisfaction, with a health care focus. In the next section we identify specific topics for research; a comprehensive review is appropriate for many of these.

We identified only four methodological papers (i.e., studies investigating measurement, statistics, or ways to obtain and analyze data). Most studies employ methodology developed elsewhere; this is not surprising, given de-

velopment of PNP from FP marketing. However, we believe some PNP/FP marketing differences require new methodologies. For example, to study PNP goals and objectives, new methodology is needed to measure multiple, subjective and nonfinancial goals. To study the marketing of ideas, causes and values, methodological work is needed to measure stages in achieving change and so provide marketing effectiveness data.

By contrast with suggestions for more effort, we believe two popular research types should receive less emphasis. First, fewer general normative articles are needed. It is clear that marketing is important for PNPs; normative work should focus on key PNP/FP differences. Second, we recommend less descriptive research. As noted above, many testable propositions and hypotheses are available, or authors can develop their own hypotheses.

In summary, we have several clear suggestions for research types to guide PNP marketing research efforts that will both advance the field and make research more attractive to major marketing journals. Reviews consolidate existing knowledge; theory development and relationship testing push forward the frontiers. New methodology is required for some PNP marketing areas, but we suggest relatively less emphasis on normative and descriptive research.

Research Topic

Our basic perspective in laying out directions for PNP research topics is that as a marketing subfield, research in PNP marketing should advance the marketing field as a whole. We believe progress can be made most effectively by a focus on areas where PNP and FP marketing differ. Thus, we organize this section by general differences between PNP and FP marketing.

Before we commence this task, however, the ethnocentricity of PNP research should be addressed. At the 1985 Association for Consumer Research conference, President Jagdish Sheth (1985) bemoaned the fact that the consumer behavior discipline was predominantly North American in orientation; the same is true for PNP marketing. We reviewed pitifully few articles from outside the United States, either in terms of research inspiration or data collection. Furthermore, since the United States lies at one end of a free enterprise-totalitarian state continuum, perhaps the United States experience is atypical when viewed from a global perspective. Possible research areas include: the role of PNP marketing in those noncommunist countries where governments are more active than in the U.S. (e.g., most of Western Europe), in communist countries, and in communist countries in transition (e.g., Poland); state-owned enterprises (Capon 1981); and the transition from PNP to FP (e.g., USSR and China).

Cross-border issues are another fruitful research area. Although relatively few PNPs are active internationally, there are nonetheless some important multinationals (e.g., United Nations, Oxfam, Amnesty International). We know little about the marketing issues that confront them nor the issues faced by countries involved in nationstate marketing for tourism and political purposes.

In addition, some types of PNP are little studied; research is particularly needed on ideologists, groups trying to change behavior, municipal services and government organizations.

Exchange. PNP exchanges are more complex than for FPs; they are not always voluntary and it is often difficult to discern the nature of the exchange. An alternative model for PNP marketing is persuasion; in this formulation, voluntary exchange is one of several methods for an organization to secure the behavior it requires (Fennell 1985). Capon and Mauser (1981) argue that marketing is a technology for changing behavior; satisfying customer needs, the heart of the marketing concept, is one of several persuasive means available to the organization.

Research dealing with these conflicting perspectives is needed; theory development would be especially valuable, notably to integrate work on compliance gaining with notions of exchange. In addition, there is insufficient research on the interaction between different compliance gaining techniques; for example, communication and laws.

Organization goals and objectives. Since PNP goals are typically non-financial, and stated with less clarity than FP financial goals (Hatten 1982), PNP missions are important for determining strategy. However, mission development is complicated because PNPs face multiple interest groups with different needs; have communication difficulties among board members due to diversity in backgrounds; and difficulty, due to externalities, in precisely identifying who the organization affects (Hatten 1982). Mission definition is particularly important for PNP managers who believe their cause or offering is so good it will sell itself; such managers may fail to develop a statement of the offering, much less a marketing plan (Selby 1978). Mission development and modification is an important research area; unfortunately we know little about these processes, nor about the roles played by professional staff, trustees and other publics in decisions regarding mission. Only Hamelman (1970), who recommends that universities set priorities among goals, addresses mission development. Normative work would be invaluable to many PNP managers.

PNPs have multiple goals (requiring trade-offs) that are typically neither objective nor financial. Research is needed to understand how PNP managers make critical tradeoffs between conflicting goals and to extend work

on goal-strategy relationships beyond a single organization type (e.g., Walters, Mangold and Haran 1976, on schools) to more holistic approaches. In addition, more normative research to develop goal-related criteria that are quantifiable, consistent and shared by others, and to develop systems that incorporate the trade-offs and conflicts inherent in setting multiple goals and objectives (Lovelock and Weinberg 1978), would be valuable. Finally, many PNPs (especially Ps) have equity goals (Murray 1975). Crompton and Lamb (1985) are among the few that address equity; this area needs more research.

Corporate strategy. PNPs spend far less effort on diversification, foreign markets, new product R&D and acquisitions than many FPs. Research is needed into the constraints that prevent most PNPs from expanding activities and into the forces driving growth-oriented PNPs. Recently many FPs have formed strategic alliances; research could identify the issues for PNPs in developing similar strategies. Also, technological change is having a major impact in FPs; research is needed into implications for PNPs. Furthermore, PNPs are frequently restricted in closing down or divesting services; research is needed on service withdrawal such as Cooper, Kehoe and Bushman's (1979) decision-making model for eliminating health-care services.

Because of the complexity in managing portfolios of businesses, many FPs engage in planning activities; FP planning systems typically employ financial control systems and may embrace corporate, business and marketing planning (Capon, Farley and Hulbert 1988). Since corporate and business strategy are frequently synonymous in PNPs (because they are not diversified), the level of planning expertise in general, and marketing planning in particular, is likely to be lower. Despite a few studies on how PNPs plan (e.g., Allen and Peters 1983; Branch 1970; Murphy 1984), more research is needed into how PNPs, especially NPs, plan and the variables that affect the ways they plan.

Because PNPs are often concerned with equity among constituencies or goals of behavior change (e.g., stopping smoking), they target those least likely to change (e.g., chain smokers). To reach unreceptive segments and/or the whole market increases the difficulty and cost of reaching goals. Approaches range from avoiding segmentation (Rothschild 1979) to targeting too many segments (e.g., Lovelock and Weinberg 1975). Research to date shows that segments can be identified (e.g., Bamossy and Semenik 1981); future work should measure the receptivity of segments to different marketing approaches (see Kelly 1987). Application of FP marketing research to targeting multiple segments would also be appropriate.

Multiple publics. To attract users, donors, volunteers and so forth, PNPs need marketing programs for each public. Because differences across publics are likely to be great, formulating comprehensive marketing strategy is difficult. We found one empirical study on strategy interaction (i.e., Shein-

kopf, Atkin and Bowen 1972 on volunteers and voters). This area provides a host of research opportunities: how do PNPs make trade-offs among different publics; how do PNPs integrate marketing strategy across publics; what are the methods for, and implications of, adding/deleting publics; what processes are available for involving representatives of publics in resolving conflict and decision-making; what new methodologies can measure the impact of marketing actions on diverse publics and so guide strategy development.

Research on specific PNP publics needs more theory derivation, like Kelly (1987) on types of museum visitors, patrons and volunteers; also empirical work should be more theory driven, like Oliver and Burger's (1979) test of models for health behavior. Furthermore, most research concerns consumers, donors or voters; future work should include other publics including taxpayers, recipients of government programs and volunteers.

Offerings. We reviewed offerings research under headings of consumer behavior, segmentation, communications and distribution, and product strategy and price. Important research questions concern the relevance of concepts and theories from FP research to PNPs. Examples are perceived risk, cognitive dissonance, opinion leadership and innovators-followers (Murphy 1979). Normative influence on PNP consumers is studied, but there is little research on social influence effects on other publics—donors, volunteers and voters. Also, research on consumers could extend to leisure-time products (e.g., parks) and joint decisions (e.g., college choice).

Most offerings research focuses on a single PNP type; it is important to generalize findings to more types. Similarly, many papers concern one marketing mix element (e.g. communications); research is needed on combinations. (Weinberg (1980) and Cooper-Martin (1990) study all four elements). In addition, work on distribution and public relations is sparse and needed.

PNPs that offer services, ideas, causes and values, and public goods face a host of issues that do not arise for those FPs whose major offerings are physical goods.

Services. Since services are distinguished from physical goods by intangibility, inseparability, variability, perishability and labor intensity, several aspects of consumer behavior are apt to differ from goods (Zeithaml 1981). Since consumers cannot hear, see, taste or touch services (intangibility), it is difficult to evaluate them. We reviewed many studies of consumer evaluation of services (e.g., mass transit—Tybout, Hauser and Koppelman 1978; health care—Neslin 1983) but found less work on information search, evoked sets, adoption and loyalty. Research is also needed on ways to reduce risk; for example, increasing users' confidence before purchase (Lovelock and

Weinberg 1978), focusing on tangible aspects of service and delivery, and maintaining a quality-price relationship (Berry 1980).

Since production and consumption occur simultaneously (inseparability), services cannot be separated from their sources and often have high variability (Berry 1980). Research is needed on ways to reduce variability. Services cannot be inventoried (perishability), so unused capacity and excess demand are problems (Lovelock 1984). Drumwright and Vernon (1984) develop "synchromarketing" that helps balance supply and demand, but more research is needed (Berry 1980; Kotler and Andreasen 1987). Many services require people to provide them (labor intensity) and limitations on replacement of labor with capital hinders productivity increases; research that deals with increasing cost pressures is needed. Managing service providers is critical to marketing services and it may be useful to treat employees as internal customers (Berry 1980); research is needed on transferring marketing concepts and principles from an external to an internal focus.

Finally, service is increasingly important in FP marketing, either as pure services or as service components of physical products; thus service research can benefit both FPs and PNPs.

Ideas, causes and values. We found little research on ideologically-oriented PNPs for whom implementing the marketing orientation is very difficult or impossible given the mission (Bloom and Novelli 1981). Rather than provide products and services to meet customers' latent or expressed desires and needs as closely as possible (Kotler 1972), PNPs offering ideas, causes and values can adapt the environment (Pfeffer and Salancik 1978) or modify people's behavior (Capon and Mauser 1982) to meet their goals. Research is needed on how such PNPs can benefit from marketing and how to adapt organizations to use this knowledge.

Consumer behavior research is needed on ideas, causes and values. Topics included are: summarizing product concepts (Bloom and Novelli 1981); changing established behavior patterns where marketing efforts are unlikely to be successful (Rothschild 1979); and determining what influences the thoughts, values or behaviors the organization is trying to change (e.g., Smith and Scammon (1987) on the decision to exercise). Other researchable areas are identifying segments based on behavior patterns (e.g., Semenik and Young (1979) for the arts), and strategies to maintain new behavior over time; Bratic, Greenberg and Petersen (1981) and Freimuth (1985) argue that mass communication is one approach. Finally, research on laws that are realistic about expected behavior (Lovelock and Weinberg 1978) would be valuable.

Because ideas, causes and values require specific behaviors, consumer costs are not only monetary but include time, effort, inconvenience and psychic costs such as fear, pride or love (Rothschild 1979). Nonfinancial costs are

more difficult to measure but, as noted earlier, have received little research attention. (Fox (1980) is an exception).

Art objects and ideologies. Aesthetic or ideological products have abstract qualities, nonutilitarian purposes and a holistic nature (Hirschman 1983). Researchers (e.g., Bamossy 1985; Day 1985) examined consumers for aesthetic products, but none considers ideologies. Multiattribute or conjoint models frequently used for FP products do not recognize these characteristics and so may be inappropriate (Hirschman 1983). Research is needed to develop constructs and measurement instruments that take into account the special characteristics of these products, especially their hedonic and symbolic aspects; such research would allow greater use of preference and choice models (Semenik 1987).

Public goods. Demand determination is difficult for public goods (Ostrom and Ostrom 1971). First, consumers may distort feedback; to avoid payment, they may deny they want a service (e.g., better public schools), but still derive benefit if provided. Second, preferences may be distorted when government constituencies (e.g., voting districts) do not reflect public preferences. Third, the value of public goods depends on the extent and manner of use (e.g., a park's value is reduced by high usage and loud radios). Finally, the absence of voluntary exchange for government-mandated services hinders meaningful feedback on user preferences. Strategies for Ps may be limited by legal restrictions on introducing and eliminating offerings (Rainey, Backoff, and Levine 1976). There is little marketing research on public goods. Preference measures for public goods and choice models that capture demand distortions are especially needed.

Public scrutiny. Public opinion may constrain advertising, promotion and other activities considered "wasteful" or "inappropriate" (Bloom and Novelli 1981). Press coverage can affect managers' goals, time horizons and their ability to recruit people and money. Close press coverage may also complicate competitive responses that require secrecy (Bower 1977). Valuable research would investigate criteria for wastefulness and inappropriateness and identify how PNPs can avoid the negative consequences of public scrutiny. Also, research might examine the effectiveness of "inappropriate" activities and measure the "value" of public scrutiny.

Market exposure. PNPs suffer three general effects as a result of little market exposure (Rainey, Backoff and Levine 1976). They have fewer incentives to reduce costs, operate efficiently and perform effectively; allocations are inefficient because consumer preferences have little influence and supply does not meet demand; PNPs cannot use market indicators of demand and market-based measures of performance.

These problems are especially apparent in securing resources; we reviewed several studies on donations and votes. Future research should extend beyond communications to other marketing mix elements. The most extensive work on choice processes is on voter decision making; this should be broadened to publics such as volunteers and taxpayers. These two areas need more research in general. Volunteers need research since control is often difficult and ideology may be pitted against sound management practice. Also, volunteers may affect the offering directly by enacting preferences or indirectly in their roles as service providers (Kelly 1987).

A particularly important issue that joins several areas is absence of a monetary price; this could form the focus of research effort.¹¹ Finally, research should address planning, control and feedback systems that incorporate a lack of market exposure.

Competition. Because of differences between PNP and FP competition, the paucity of research on PNP competition was a great disappointment. Research should examine factors that determine whether comparable PNPs are treated as competitors or collaborators, the dynamics of collaboration and competition for donors, volunteers, trustees and so forth. Opportunities for joint service development and other marketing efforts should be investigated. Finally, research should question whether competition differs as regards PNP versus PNP; FP versus FP; PNP versus FP.

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

This review commences by identifying eight global differences between PNPs and FPs. These differences are the major justification for treating PNP and FP marketing separately. To organize our review of research in PNP marketing, we developed two typologies. The seven research types are different approaches to research; the research topics comprise seven conventional marketing topics and one specific to PNP marketing.

A review of 15 journals, two annual proceedings and a research volume, published over a 20-year period, yields 293 PNP marketing articles. Many are descriptive or general normative research; we recommend reduced effort in these areas and increased effort on theory development and testing, especially for programmatic research on subtopics within the field. More specialized review articles and appropriate methodological development would also be valuable.

¹¹Zero prices also arise when PNPs have goals that prohibit customers' paying for services (e.g., free concerts to maximize public exposure; no fee adoption services for pets). Implications of removal of such an important demand balancing element and the impact of zero-price quality perceptions on consumer behavior are both interesting research topics.

Consumer behavior, and communications and distribution, were the most studied research topics. Many studies focused on individual industry sub-segments (e.g., education, health care, performing arts). Despite marketing-related differences between segments, the PNP field is likely to advance more swiftly if focused on differences between PNP and FP marketing and on similarities within PNP marketing, than from studies with specific PNP foci.

To this end we organized directions for future research by PNP/FP differences. We urge PNP marketing researchers explicitly to articulate similarities and differences from FP marketing for their topics. Most authors did not, yet such articulation would have two benefits. First, articles would not simply replicate FP marketing in a PNP context, with little value for advancing the field, but would concern a unique aspect of PNP marketing. Second, articulation would assist the generalization of results across PNPs and distinguish the field more clearly from FP marketing.

REFERENCES

- Adams, Arthur J. and Subhash C. Lonial (1984), "Investigation of Giving Behavior to United Way Using Log-Linear Modeling and Discriminant Analysis: An Empirical Study," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 12 (Summer), 77-88.
- Allen, Bruce H. and William H. Peters (1983), "The Status of Strategic Marketing in Higher Education: College Presidents' Viewpoints," *1983 AMA Educators' Proceedings*, Patrick E. Murphy et al., eds., Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Allen, Charles T., Charles D. Schewe, and Judith D. Weber (1981), "An Empirical Assessment of the Relative Marketing Orientations of Museum Directors and Marketing Practitioners," *The Changing Marketing Environment: New Theories and Applications*, Kenneth Bernhardt, et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Anderson, Robert and R. Eugene Klippel (1976), "How Effective Are Public Policy Decisions? . . . The Need for a General Evaluation Model," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 4 (Summer), 554-565.
- Andreasen, Alan R. (1981), "Intermediary Strategies for Non-Profit Organizations," *Marketing of Services*, James H. Donnelly and William R. George, eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- and Russell W. Belk (1980), "Predictors of Attendance at the Performing Arts," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 7 (September), 112-120.

- Arndt, Johan (1978), "How Broad Should the Marketing Concept Be?" *Journal of Marketing*, 42 (January), 101-103.
- Arnold, Danny R., Louis M. Capella and Delia A. Sumrall (1987a), "Organization Culture and the Marketing Concept: Diagnostic Keys for Hospitals," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 7 (March), 18-28.
- _____, _____ and _____ (1987b) "Hospital Challenge: Using Change Theory and Processes to Adopt and Implement the Marketing Concept," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 7 (June), 15-24.
- Bamossey, Gary (1985), "Aesthetic Judgment and Arts Patronage of Adolescents," *Advances in Nonprofit Marketing*, Vol. 1, Russell W. Belk ed. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- _____, _____ and Richard J. Semenik (1981), "Tangible and Intangible Motivators of Performing Arts Patronage," *The Changing Marketing Environment: New Theories and Applications*, Kenneth Bernhardt, et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Barby, David N. and Ian F. Wilkinson (1987), "Self-Care in Health Care: Theory and Research," *Advances in Nonprofit Marketing*, Vol. 2, Russell W. Belk ed. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- Barff, Richard, David Mackay and Richard W. Olshavsky (1982), "A Selective Review of Travel-Mode Choice Models," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 8 (March), 370-380.
- Barnett, Mark A., Michael Klassen, Vera McMinimy and Laurel Schwarz (1987), "The Role of Self- and Other- Oriented Motivation in the Organ Donation Decision," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 14, Melanie Wallendorf and Paul Anderson, eds. Provo, UT: Association for Consumer Research.
- Barry, Thomas E., Mary C. Gilly, and William R. Schucany (1982), "Students as Consumers: Predicting Satisfaction," *An Assessment of Marketing Thought and Practice*, Bruce J. Walker et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Beik, Leland L. and Scott M. Smith (1979), "Geographic Segmentation: A Fund-raising Example," *1979 Educators' Conference Proceedings*, Neil Beckwith et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Belk, Russell W. and Alan R. Andreasen (1980), "De Gustibus Non Est Disputandum: A Study of the Potential for Broadening the Appeal of Performing Arts," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 7, Jerry C. Olson, ed. Ann Arbor, MI: Association for Consumer Research.
- Berkowitz, Eric N. (1981), "Health Care Marketing: Issues for Future Development," *Marketing of Services*, James H. Donnelly and William R. George, eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.

- Berry, L. L. (1980), "Services Marketing is Different," *Business*, (May/June), 24-29.
- and William J. Kehoe (1980), "Problems and Guidelines in University Marketing," *Marketing in the 80s: Changes and Challenges*, Richard P. Bagozzi et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Block, Peter H. (1984), "The Wellness Movement: Imperatives for Health Care Marketers," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 4 (Winter), 9-16.
- Bloom, Paul N. and William D. Novelli (1981), "Problems and Challenges in Social Marketing," *Journal of Marketing*, 45 (Spring), 79-88.
- Bower, Joseph L. (1977), "Effective public management," *Harvard Business Review*, 55 (March-April), 131-140.
- Bowers, Michael R. (1987), "Developing New Services for Hospitals: A Suggested Model," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 7 (June), 35-44.
- Branch, Melville C. (1970), "Delusions and Diffusions of City Planning in the United States," *Management Science*, 12 (August), 714-731.
- Bratic, Elaine, Rachel Greenberg, and Phyllis Petersen (1981), "HMTS: Improving the Quality of Public Service Announcements through Standardized Pretesting," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 9 (Winter), 40-51.
- Brockner, Joel, Beth Guzzi, Julie Kane, Ellen Levine, and Kate Shaplen (1984), "Organizational Fundraising: Further Evidence on the Effect of Legitimizing Small Donations," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 11 (June), 611-614.
- Brown, Daniel J., Philip B. Schary, and Boris W. Becker (1978), "Marketing Down the Road: The Role of Marketing Analysis in Transformation Planning," *Research Frontiers in Marketing: Dialogues and Directions*, Subhash C. Jain, ed. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Burnett, John J. (1981), "Psychographic and Demographic Characteristics of Blood Donors," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 8 (June), 62-66.
- and James H. Leigh (1986), "Distinguishing Characteristics of Blood Donor Segments Defined in Terms of Donation Frequency," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 6 (June), 38-48.

- Busch, Paul and James Farrell (1981), "Market Share's Role in Health Care Management," *The Changing Marketing Environment: New Theories and Applications*, Kenneth Bernhardt, et al, eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Caiden, Gerald E. (1971), *The Dynamics of Public Administration*. Hinsdale, IL: Dryden Press.
- Capon, Noel (1981), "Marketing Strategy Differences Between States and Privately Owned Corporations: An Explanatory Analysis," *Journal of Marketing*, 45 (Spring), 11-18.
- John U. Farley, and James M. Hulbert (1988), *Corporate Strategic Planning*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- and Gary Mauser (1982), "A Review of Nonprofit Marketing Texts," *Journal of Marketing*, 46 (Summer), 125-129.
- Carroll, Vincent P., Ambar G. Rao, Hau L. Lee, Arthur Shapiro, and Barry L. Bayus (1985), "Applications: The Navy Enlistment Marketing Experiment," *Marketing Science*, 4 (Fall), 352-374.
- Chapman, Randall G. and Marc S. Franklin (1981), "Measuring the Impact of High School Visits: A Preliminary Investigation," *The Changing Marketing Environment: New Theories and Applications*, Kenneth Bernhardt, et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- and Kristian S. Palda (1980), "The Effect of Campaign Expenditures on Voting: Evidence from Canadian Provincial Elections," *Marketing in the 80s: Changes and Challenges*, Richard P. Bagozzi et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- and ——— (1983), "Electoral Turnout in Rational Voting and Consumption Perspectives," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 9 (March), 337-346.
- and ——— (1984), "Assessing the Influence of Campaign Expenditures on Voting Behavior with a Comprehensive Electoral Market Model," *Marketing Science*, 3 (Summer), 207-226.
- Chow, Stanley H. L., C. L. Hutchins, and Linda A. Sikorski (1974), "Diffusing Educational R & D Innovations to School Organizations," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 1, Scott Ward and Peter Wright, eds. Urbana, IL: Association for Consumer Research.
- Clarke, Roberta N. (1979), "The Case Management Program: Applied Medicaid Marketing," *1979 Educators' Conference Proceedings*, Neil Beckwith et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- (1981), "Moving from Concept to Action: Strategic Barriers in Health Care Marketing," *Marketing of Services*, James H. Donnelly and William R. George, eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.

- Coleman, Pat (1984), "Public Libraries Can and Do Make a Difference" *European Journal of Marketing*, 18 (2), 56-64.
- Cooper, Philip D., William J. Kehoe, and F. Anthony Bushman (1979), "A Service Elimination Model for the Health Care Sector," *1979 Educators' Conference Proceedings*, Neil Beckwith et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Cooper-Martin, Elizabeth (1990), "An Exploration of the Impact of Marketing Mix Variables on Museum Attendance," *Empirical Studies of the Arts*, 8(2), 135-147.
- Craig, C. Samuel, Terry Deutscher, and John M. McCann (1977), "Segmenting Charitable Givers: An Application of TOBIT," *Contemporary Marketing Thought*, Barnett A. Greenberg and Danny N. Bellenger, eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Crompton, John L. and Charles W. Lamb, Jr. (1983), "The Importance of the Equity Concept in the Allocation of Public Services," *Journal of Macro-marketing*, 3, (Spring), 28-40.
- Cronin, Blaise (1984), "The Marketing of Public Library Services in the UK—The Rationale of a Marketing Approach," *European Journal of Marketing*, 18 (2), 33-44.
- Crosby, Lawrence A. and James R. Taylor (1983), "Psychological Commitment and Its Effects on Post-Decision Evaluation and Preference Stability Among Voters," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 9 (March), 413-431.
- Currim, Imran S., Charles B. Weinberg, and Dick R. Wittink (1981), "Design of Subscription Programs for a Performing Arts Series," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 8 (June), 67-75.
- Day, Ellen (1985), "Accounting for Musical Tastes, Preferences, and Attendance Patterns," *Advances in Nonprofit Marketing*, Vol. 1, Russell W. Belk ed. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- Drucker, Peter (1989), "Management Guru Calls on Nonprofit to Abandon Programs That Don't Work," *The Nonprofit Times*, 3 (May), 10-11.
- Drumwright, Minette E. and Ivan R. Vernon (1984), "Synchronmarketing: A New Concept for Hospital Administrators," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 4 (Spring), 45-50.
- Dubinsky, Alan J. and Paul J. Hensel (1982), "Identifying Rationale for Membership Termination in a Nonprofit Service Organization," *An Assessment of Marketing Thought and Practice*, Bruce J. Walker et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Duhaime, Carole P., Ronald McTavish, and Christopher A. Ross (1985), "Social Marketing: An Approach to Third World Development," *Journal of Macromarketing*, 5 (Spring), 3-13.

- Dunbar, Frederick C. and Volney Steffire (1980), "Drawing Power Among Transportation Energy Conservation Promotions and Product Concepts," *Marketing in the 80s: Changes and Challenges*, Richard P. Bagozzi et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Dyer, Robert F., Philip G. Kuel, and Jack M. Williams (1974), "Perspectives on Social Marketing: The Case of Tangible Product-Social Cause Offerings," *New Marketing for Social and Economic Progress and Marketing's Contribution to the Firm and to the Society*, Ronald C. Curhan, ed. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Enis, Ben M. (1973), "Deepening the Concept of Marketing," *Journal of Marketing*, 44 (Fall), 24-33.
- Etgar, Michael and Brian T. Ratchford (1974), "Non-Profit Organizations," *New Marketing for Social and Economic Progress and Marketing's Contribution to the Firm and to the Society*, Ronald C. Curhan, ed. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Farley, John U. and Harold J. Leavitt (1971), "Marketing and Population Problems," *Journal of Marketing*, 35 (July), 28-33.
- Feldman, Laurence P. (1973), "The Marketing of Urban Mass Transit," *1973 Combined Proceedings: Increasing Marketing Productivity and Conceptual and Methodological Foundations of Marketing*, Thomas V. Greer, ed. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Fennell, Geraldine (1985), "Persuasion: Marketing as Behavioral Science in Business and Nonbusiness Contexts," *Advances in Nonprofit Marketing*, Vol. 1, Russell W. Belk ed. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- Ferrell, O. C., Charles S. Madden and Donna Legg (1986), "Strategic Planning for Nonprofit Health Care Organization Funding," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 6 (March), 13-22.
- Fine, Seymour H. (1987), "Social and Nonprofit Marketing: Some Trends and Issues," *Advances in Nonprofit Marketing*, Vol 2, Russell W. Belk ed. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- Finn, David W. and Charles W. Lamb, Jr. (1986), "Hospital Benefit Segmentation," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 6 (December), 26-33.
- Flaschner, Alan B., A. Edward Spitz, Catherine E. Rosen, Lane A. Gerber, and Jack L. Simonetti (1977), "Changing Attitudes and Behavior Toward Community Mental Health Centers," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 5 (Summer), 168-179.
- Ford, David (1976), "The Marketing of Non-profit Making Organisations: A Preliminary Report," *European Journal of Marketing*, 10 (5), 266-279.

- Fox, Karen F. A. (1980), "Time as a Component of Price in Social Marketing," *Marketing in the 80s: Changes and Challenges*, Richard P. Bagozzi et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- (1981), "The Public Schools as Intermediaries," *Marketing of Services*, James H. Donnelly and William R. George, eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- and William Ihlanfeldt (1980), "Determining Market Potential in Higher Education," *Marketing in the 80s: Changes and Challenges*, Richard P. Bagozzi et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- and Philip Kotler (1980), "The Marketing of Social Causes: The First 10 Years," *Journal of Marketing*, 44 (Fall), 24–33.
- Foxall, Gordon (1984), "The Meaning of Marketing and Leisure: Issues for Research and Development," *European Journal of Marketing*, 18 (2), 23–32.
- Freimuth, Vicki S. (1985), "Developing the Public Service Advertisement for Non-profit Marketing," *Advances in Nonprofit Marketing*, Vol. 1, Russell W. Belk ed. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- Frisbie, Gil A. and Susan M. Petroschius (1985), "Career Perceptions and Influencing Factors on Business Students Choice of Major," *1985 AMA Educators' Proceedings*, Robert F. Lusch et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- George, William R. and Fran T. Compton (1985), "How to Initiate a Marketing Perspective in a Health Service Organization," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 5 (Winter), 29–38.
- Golden, Linda L. and Mark I. Alpert (1978), "The Relative Effectiveness of One-Sided and Two-Sided Communication for Mass Transit Advertising," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 5, H. Keith Hunt, ed. Chicago: Association for Consumer Research.
- , John F. Betak and Mark I. Alpert (1979), "Attracting Potential Switchers to Mass Transit: Mode Choice as a Multi-Attribute Decision Model," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 6, William L. Wilke, ed. Ann Arbor, MI: Association for Consumer Research.
- Hackman, Judith Dozier (1985), "Power and Centrality in the Allocation of Resources in Colleges and Universities," *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 30 (March), 61–77.
- Hamelman, Paul W. (1970), "Missions, Matrices, and University Management," *Academy of Management Journal*, 13 (March), 35–47.
- Hampton, Gerald M. (1983), "College Student Satisfaction: Marketing's Approach for Evaluating Higher Education," *1983 AMA Educators' Proceedings*, Patrick E. Murphy et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.

- Hardy, L. W. (1981), "Theatre Objectives and Marketing Planning," *European Journal of Marketing*, 15 (4), 3-16.
- Harrell, Gilbert D. and Matthew F. Fors (1985), "Marketing Ambulatory Care to Women: A Segmentation Approach," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 5 (Spring), 19-28.
- Hartley, Steven W. and Eric N. Berkowitz (1983), "Identifying Membership Strategies: An Investigation of University Alumni," *1983 AMA Educators' Proceedings*, Patrick E. Murphy et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Hatten, Mary Louise (1982), "Strategic Management in Not-For-Profit Organizations," *Strategic Management Journal*, 3 (April-June), 89-104.
- Havlena, William J. and Susan L. Holak (1988), "The Influence of Variety on the Demand for Bundles of Musical Performances," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 15, Michael J. Houston, ed. Provo, UT: Association for Consumer Research.
- Hawes, Jon M. and George Glisan (1983), "A Marketing Approach to Student Evaluation of a Department of Marketing," *1983 AMA Educators' Proceedings*, Patrick E. Murphy et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- and C. P. Rao (1985), "Using Importance-Performance Analysis to Develop Health Care Marketing Strategies," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 5 (Fall), 19-26.
- Henion, Karl E. and Richard R. Batsell (1976), "Marketing of Blood Donorship, Helping Behavior, and Psychological Reactance," *Marketing: 1776-1976 and Beyond*, Kenneth L. Bernhardt, ed. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Hinrichs, Harley H. and Graeme M. Taylor (1972), *Systematic Analysis*. Pacific Palisades, CA: Goodyear Publishing Co.
- Hirschman, Elizabeth C. (1983), "Aesthetics, Ideologies and the Limits of the Marketing Concept," *Journal of Marketing*, 47 (Summer), 45-55.
- Holbrook, Morris B. and Robert B. Zirlin (1985), "Artistic Creation, Artworks, Aesthetic Appreciation: Some Philosophical Contributions to Nonprofit Marketing," *Advances in Nonprofit Marketing*, Vol. 1, Russell W. Belk ed. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- Hollander, Stanley C. (1981), "Not-For-Profit Organizations as Channel Intermediaries," *The Changing Marketing Environment: New Theories and Applications*, Kenneth Bernhardt, et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Houston, Michael J. (1980), "Cognitive Structure and Information Search Patterns of Prospective Graduate Business Students," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 8, Kent B. Monroe, ed. Ann Arbor, MI: Association for Consumer Research.
- Hudson, Laurel A. and Stephen W. Brown (1983), "Preventative Health Care Consumer Socialization: Implications for Influencing Agents," *Advances in Consumer*

- Research*, Vol. 10, Richard P. Bagozzi and Alice M. Tybout eds. Ann Arbor, MI: Association for Consumer Research.
- Johnston, Denis and Gabriel Rudney (1986), "Nonprofit Employment: Trends, Projections, and Characteristics," working paper no. 116, Program on Non-Profit Organizations, Yale University.
- Jones, J. Richard and Philip D. Cooper (1981), "The Integration of a Logistical Decision-Making Framework into Nonprofit Marketing," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 9 (Winter), 28-39.
- Katona, George (1982), "Selling Government Programs," *Journal of Macromarketing*, 2 (Fall), 38-42.
- Kelly, Robert F. (1987), "Museums as Status Symbols: Attaining a State of Having Been," *Advances in Nonprofit Marketing*, Vol. 2, Russell W. Belk ed. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- Kerlinger, Fred N. (1973), *Foundations of Behavior Research*. New York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston, Inc.
- Kotler, Philip (1972), "A Generic Concept of Marketing," *Journal of Marketing*, 36 (April), 46-54.
- (1975), *Marketing for Nonprofit Organizations*, Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- and Alan R. Andreason (1987), *Strategic Marketing for Nonprofit Organizations*, Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice-Hall.
- and Sidney J. Levy (1969a), "Broadening the Concept of Marketing," *Journal of Marketing*, 33 (January), 10-15.
- and ——— (1969b), "A New Form of Marketing Myopia: Rejoinder of Professor Luck," *Journal of Marketing*, 33 (July), 55-57.
- and Gerald Zaltman (1971), "Social Marketing: An Approach to Planned Social Change," *Journal of Marketing*, 35 (July), 3-12.
- Kovach, Carol (1978), "A Hungary Problem for Zoos: In Search of New Prey," *Research Frontiers in Marketing: Dialogues and Directions*, Subhash C. Jain, ed. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Krapfel, Robert (1980), "Public Sector Marketing: The Solar Energy Experience," *Marketing in the 80s: Changes and Challenges*, Richard P. Bagozzi et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Krone, Flavia, Mary Gilly, Valarie Zeithaml, and Charles W. Lamb, Jr. (1981), "Factors Influencing the Graduate Business School Decision," *The Changing Marketing Environment: New Theories and Applications*, Kenneth Bernhardt, et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.

- Laczniak, Gene R. and Clarke L. Caywood (1987), "The Case For and Against Televised Political Advertising: Implications for Research and Public Policy," *Journal of Public Policy and Marketing*, 6, 16-32.
- Lamb, Charles W. and John L. Crompton (1981), "The Status of the Marketing Concept in Public Recreation and Park Agencies," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 9 (Winter), 1-14.
- and ——— (1985), "Distribution Decisions for Public Services," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 13 (Summer), 66-76.
- Legum, Lynn Tracey and William R. George (1981), "Analysis of Marketing Management Practices of Dance Companies," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 9 (Winter), 15-26.
- Litten, Larry H. (1981), "Educational Essentials and the Marketing of Higher Education," *Marketing of Services*, James H. Donnelly and William R. George, eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Lovelock, Christopher H. (1975), "Researching and Modeling Consumer Choice Behavior in Urban Transportation," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 2, Mary Jane Schlinget, ed. Chicago: Association for Consumer Research.
- (1976), "Consumer Research in Urban Transportation: Some Methodological Issues," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 3, Beverlee B. Anderson, ed. Chicago, IL: Association for Consumer Research.
- (1984), *Marketing for Public and Nonprofit Managers*. New York: John Wiley and Sons.
- and Charles B. Weinberg (1974), "Contrasting Private and Public Sector Marketing," *New Marketing for Social and Economic Progress and Marketing's Contribution to the Firm and to the Society*, Ronald C. Curhan, ed. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- and ——— (1975), "Contrasting Private and Public Sector Marketing," *1974 Combined Proceedings*. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- and ——— (1977), *Cases in Public and Nonprofit Marketing*, Palo Alto, CA: The Scientific Press.
- and ——— (1978), "Public and Nonprofit Marketing Comes of Age," *Review of Marketing 1978*, G. Zaltman and T. Bonoma, eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Luck, David J. (1969), "Marketing Notes and Communications," *Journal of Marketing*, 33 (July), 53-63.
- Lynch, James E. (1978), "Hertford College, Oxford: A Case Study in Non-profit Marketing," *Advertising Quarterly*, 55 (Spring), 28-30.

- MacLachlan, Douglas L. and Douglas V. Leister (1974), "Institutional Positioning: A Metamarketing Application," *New Marketing for Social and Economic Progress and Marketing's Contribution to the Firm and to the Society*, Ronald C. Curhan, ed. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Malhotra, Naresh K. (1983), "Stochastic Modeling of Consumer Preferences for Health Care Institutions," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 3 (Fall), 18-26.
- Massey, Tom K., Jr. and Faye W. Blake (1987), "Estimating Market Boundaries for Health Care Facilities and Services," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 7 (September), 15-24.
- Mathews, H. Lee and Roger D. Blackwell (1980), "Implementing Marketing in Higher Education," *Marketing in the 80s: Changes and Challenges*, Richard P. Bagozzi et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- McDevitt, Paul K. and Lisa A. Shields (1985), "Tactical Hospital Marketing: A Survey of the State of the Art," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 5 (Winter), 9-16.
- McIntyre, Pat, Mark A. Barnett, Richard J. Harris, James Shanteau, John Skowronski, and Michael Klassen (1987), "Psychological Factors Influencing Decisions to Donate Organs," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 14, Melanie Wallendorf and Paul Anderson, eds. Provo, UT: Association for Consumer Research.
- Miller, Stephen J. and William G. Zikmund (1979), "Innovative Health Care Alternatives: A Model of the Consumer Behavior Process," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 6, William L. Wilkie ed. Ann Arbor, MI: Association for Consumer Research.
- Montanari, John R. and Jeffrey S. Bracker (1986), "The Strategic Management Process at the Public Planning Unit Level," *Strategic Management Journal*, 3 (May-June), 251-265.
- Moore, Ellen M., William O. Bearden and Jesse E. Teel (1985), "Use of Labeling and Assertions of Dependency in Appeals for Consumer Support," *Journal of Consumer Research*, (June), 90-96.
- Morris, Michael (1982), "The Problem of Economic Evaluation in Social Marketing," *An Assessment of Marketing Thought and Practice*, Bruce J. Walker et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Murphy, Patrick E. (1979), "The Need for Consumer Research in Higher Education," *1979 Educators' Conference Proceedings*, Neil Beckwith et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- (1980), "Marketing Nonprofit Organizations: Problems and Prospects for the 1980s," *Marketing in the 80s: Changes and Challenges*, Richard P. Bagozzi et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- (1984), "Strategic Planning at the FTC," *Journal of Public Policy and Marketing*, 3, 56-66.

- (1985), "Recruiting Blood Donors: A Marketing and Consumer Behavior Perspective," *Advances in Nonprofit Marketing*, Vol. 1, Russell W. Belk ed. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- Murray, Michael R. (1975), "Comparing Public and Private Management," *Public Administration Review*, 35 (July/August), 364-371.
- Nakanishi, Masao, Lee G. Cooper, and Harold H. Kassarian (1974), "Voting for a Political Candidate Under Conditions of Minimal Information," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 1 (September), 36-43.
- Neslin, Scott A. (1983), "Designing New Outpatient Health Services: Linking Service Features to Subjective Consumer Perceptions," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 3 (Summer), 8-21.
- Netzger, Dick (1978), *The Subsidized Muse*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Nevin, John R. and S. Tamer Cavusgil (1981), "Audience Segments for the Performing Arts," *Marketing of Services*, James H. Donnelly and William R. George eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Newman, Bruce I. and Jagdish N. Sheth (1985), "A Model of Primary Voter Behavior," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 12 (September), 178-187.
- Newman, Ray G. (1984), "A Conjoint Analysis in Outpatient Clinic Preferences," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 4 (Winter), 41-49.
- Nickels, William G. (1972), "Metamarketing and Cultural Dynamics," *Combined Proceedings: Marketing Education and the Real World and Dynamic Marketing in a Changing World*, Boris W. Becker et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Nielsen, Richard P. (1986), "Piggyback Strategies for Nonprofits: A Shared Costs Approach," *Strategic Management Journal*, 3 (May-June), 201-215.
- , Charles McQueen, and Angela B. Nielsen (1974), "Performing Arts Audience Segments," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 2 (Fall), 602-609.
- Nimmo, Dan (1975), "Images and Voters' Decision-Making Processes," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 2, Mary Jane Schlinger, ed. Chicago: Association for Consumer Research.
- Norris, Donald G. (1985), "Collaboration of Private Firms and Nonprofit Organizations in Advertising: A Review and Issues for Future Research," *1985 AMA Educators' Proceedings*, Robert F. Lusch et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Nutt, Paul C. (1984), "A Strategic Planning Network for Non-profit Organizations," *Strategic Management Journal*, 5 (January-March), 57-75.

- Octon, C. M. (1983), "A Re-examination of Marketing for British Non-Profit Organisations," *European Journal of Marketing*, 17 (5), 33-43.
- Oliver, Richard L. and Philip K. Berger (1979), "A Path Analysis of Preventive Health Care Decision Models," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 6 (September), 113-117.
- Ortinau, David J. (1986), "Discriminating Users and Non-Users of Preventive Health Care Practices and Emergency Medical Walk-in Clinics," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 6 (June), 26-37.
- and Robert L. Anderson (1986), "College Students' Post-Purchase Educational Satisfaction/Dissatisfaction Decision Process: A Conceptual Model," 1986 *AMA Educators' Proceedings*, Terence Shrimp et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Ostrom, Elinor and Vincent Ostrom (1971), "Public Choice: A Different Approach to the Study of Public Administration," *Public Administration Review*, 31 (March/April), 203-216.
- Palda, Kristian S. (1973), "The Marketing of Political Candidates: An Econometric Exploration of Two Quebec Elections," 1973 *Combined Proceedings: Increasing Marketing Productivity and Conceptual and Methodological Foundations of Marketing*, Thomas V. Greer, ed. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Parameswaran, Ravi, Jac L. Goldstucker, and Barnett A. Greenberg (1978), "A Market Opportunity Analysis for a Private Nonprofit Service Organization," *Research Frontiers in Marketing: Dialogues and Directions*, Subhash C. Jain, ed. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Pessemier, Edgar A., Albert C. Bemmaor, and Dominique M. Hanssens (1977), "Willingness to Supply Human Body Parts: Some Empirical Results," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 3 (December), 131-140.
- Pfeffer, Jeffrey and Gerald R. Salancik (1978), *The External Control of Organizations: A Resource Dependence Perspective*. New York: Harper and Row.
- Punj, Girish N. and Richard Staelin (1978), "The Choice Process for Graduate Business Schools," *Journal of Marketing Research*, 15 (November), 588-598.
- Rados, David L. (1981), *Marketing for Non-Profit Organizations*, Dover, MA: Auburn House Publishing Co., Inc.
- Rainey, Hal G., Robert W. Backoff, and Charles H. Levine (1976), "Comparing Public and Private Organizations," *Public Administration Review*, 36 (March/April), 233-244.
- Reingen, Peter H. (1978), "On Inducing Compliance with Requests," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 5 (September), 96-102.
- Revelle, Charles, David Marks and Jon C. Liebman (1970), "An Analysis of Private and Public Sector Location Models," *Management Science*, 11 (July), 692-707.

- Ritchie, J. R. Brent and Gordon H. G. McDougall (1985), "Designing and Marketing Consumer Energy Conservation Policies and Programs: Implications from a Decade of Research," *Journal of Public Policy and Marketing*, 4, 14-32.
- Robbins, John E. and Stephanie S. Robbins (1979), "Segmentation for 'Fine Arts' Marketing: Is King Tut Classless as Well as Ageless?" *1979 Educators' Conference Proceedings*, Neil Beckwith et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- and ——— (1981), "Museum Marketing: Identification of High, Moderate, and Low Attendee Segments," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 9 (Winter), 66-76.
- Robertson, Leon S. (1976), "Consumer Response to Seat Belt Use Campaigns and Inducements: Implications for Public Health Strategies," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 3, Beverlee B. Anderson, ed. Chicago: Association for Consumer Research.
- Robertson, Thomas S. and Lawrence H. Wortzel (1978), "Consumer Behavior and Health Care Change: The Role of Mass Media," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 5, H. Keith Hunt ed. Chicago: Association for Consumer Research.
- Robinson, Richard K. (1979), "Implementing the Marketing Concept to Improve Transit Information and Promotional Strategy," *1979 Educators' Conference Proceedings*, Neil Beckwith et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Rosenblatt, Jerry A., Alain J. Cusson and Lee McGown (1986), "A Model to Explain Charitable Donation—Health Care Consumer Behavior," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 13, Richard J. Lutz, ed. Gainesville, FL: Association for Consumer Research.
- Ross, Caroline K., Gayle Frommelt, Liza Hazelwood, and Rowland W. Chang (1987), "The Role of Expectations in Patient Satisfaction with Medical Care," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 7 (December), 16-26.
- Rothschild, Michael L. (1978), "Political Advertising: A Neglected Policy Issue in Marketing," *Journal of Marketing Research*, 15 (February), 58-71.
- (1979), "Marketing Communications in Nonbusiness Situations or Why It's So Hard to Sell Brotherhood Like Soap," *Journal of Marketing*, 43 (Spring), 11-20.
- and Michael J. Houston (1980), "Individual Differences in Voting Behavior: Further Investigations of Involvement," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 7, Jerry C. Olson, ed. Ann Arbor, MI: Association for Consumer Research.
- Rudelius, William, Richard Weijs, and Gary Dodge (1984), "Marketing Energy Conservation to Homeowners: An Action Program from Public Policy Research," *Journal of Public Policy and Marketing*, 3, 149-166.
- Rudney, Gabriel (1981), "A Quantitative Profile of the Nonprofit Sector," working paper #40, Program on Non-Profit Organizations, Yale University.

- Rumelt, Richard P. (1974), *Strategy, Structure and Economic Performance*. Boston: Division of Research, Harvard Business School.
- Ryans, Adrian B. and Charles B. Weinberg (1978), "Consumer Dynamics in Nonprofit Organizations," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 5 (September), 89-95.
- Sackmery, Benjamin (1985), "Service Selection in Serious Medical Situations: Implications for Marketing EMS," *Creativity in Services Marketing: What's New, What Works, What's Developing*, M. Venkatesan et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Salvatore, Tony (1984), "Competitor Analysis in Health Care Marketing," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 4 (Fall), 11-16.
- Schurr, Paul H., Lew G. Brown, and Edward Collins (1985), "Exchange Theory and the Marketing of Government Services and Policies," *1985 AMA Educators' Proceedings*, Robert F. Lusch et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Selby, Cecily Cannan (1978), "Better Performance from 'Nonprofits,'" *Advances Business Review*, 56 (September-October), 92-98.
- Semenik, Richard J. (1987), "State of the Art of Arts Marketing," *Advances in Nonprofit Marketing*, Vol. 2, Russell W. Belk ed. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- and Clifford E. Young (1980), "Correlates of Season Ticket Subscription Behavior," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 7, Jerry C. Olson, ed. Ann Arbor, Michigan: Association for Consumer Research.
- Sexton, Donald E. and Kathryn Britney (1980), "A Behavioral Segmentation of the Arts Market," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 7, Jerry C. Olson, ed. Ann Arbor, Michigan: Association for Consumer Research.
- Shama, Avraham (1976), "The Marketing of Political Candidates," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 4 (Fall), 764-777.
- Sheinkopf, Kenneth G. (1974), "Marketing Political Candidates: Why All the Fuss?" *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 2 (Winter), 401-404.
- , Charles K. Atkin, and Lawrence Bowen (1972), "The Functions of Political Advertising for Campaign Organizations," *Journal of Marketing Research*, 9 (November), 401-405.
- Sheth, Jagdish N. (1985), "Broadening the Horizons of ACR and Consumer Behavior," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 12, Elizabeth C. Hirschman and Morris Holbrook, eds. Provo, UT: Association for Consumer Research.
- Shosteck, Herschel (1976), "Media Research and Political Time Buying," *Marketing: 1776-1976 and Beyond*, Kenneth L. Bernhardt, ed. Chicago: American Marketing Association.

- Siomkos, George and Avijit Ghosh (1987), "Asymmetries in the Effect of Campaign Expenditures on Voting Patterns," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 14, Melanie Wallendorf and Paul Anderson, eds. Provo, UT: Association for Consumer Research.
- Smead, Raymond J. and John J. Burnett (1980), "Understanding the Blood Donor Problem: A Discriminant Analysis of Active, Dormant, and Non-Donors," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 7, Jerry C. Olson, ed. Ann Arbor, MI: Association for Consumer Research.
- Smith, Jackie A. and Debra L. Scammon (1987), "A Market Analysis of Adult Physical Activity: Exercise Beliefs, Attitudes, Intentions, and Behavior," *Advances in Nonprofit Marketing*, Vol. 2, Russell W. Belk ed. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- Smith, Mickey C. and Leland L. Beik (1982), "Market Segmentation for Fund Raisers," *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, 10 (Summer), 208-216.
- Smith, Scott M. (1980), "Giving to Charitable Organizations: A Behavioral Review and a Framework for Increasing Commitment," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 7, Jerry C. Olson ed. Ann Arbor, MI: Association for Consumer Research.
- Sojka, Jane R. Ziegler (1986), "Understanding Donor Behavior: A Classification Paradigm," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 13, Richard J. Lutz, ed. Gainesville, FL: Association for Consumer Research.
- Spekman, Robert E., James W. Harvey and Paul N. Bloom (1980), "The College Choice Process: Some Empirical Results," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 7, Jerry C. Olson, ed. Ann Arbor, Michigan: Association for Consumer Research.
- Steinberg, Margery, George Miaoulis, and David Lloyd (1982), "Benefit Segmentation Strategies for the Performing Arts," *An Assessment of Marketing Thought and Practice*, Bruce J. Walker et al., eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Sterne, Larry (1989), "'Merger Mania' of Corporations Fails to Lure Tax-exempt Groups," *The Nonprofit Times*, 3 (April), 1.
- Stiff, Ronald and Ira Kaufman (1975), "Social Marketing: Marketing Strategy and Consumer Response," *1975 Combined Proceedings: Marketing in Turbulent Times and Marketing: The Challenges and the Opportunities*, Edward M. Mazze, ed. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Stutts, Mary Ann and Debra Low (1981), "A Marketing Framework for Assessing the Failure of New Health Services," *Marketing of Services*, James H. Donnelly and William R. George, eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Swan, John E., Jesse C. Sawyer, Joseph G. Van Matre, and Gail W. McGee (1985), "Deepening the Understanding of Hospital Patient Satisfaction: Fulfillment and Equity Effects," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 5 (Summer), 7-18.

- Swinyard, William R. and Kenneth A. Coney (1978), "Promotional Effects on a High-Versus Low-Involvement Electorate," *Journal of Consumer Research*, 5 (June), 41-48.
- and Michael L. Ray (1977), "Advertising-Selling Interactions: An Attribution Theory Experiment," *Journal of Marketing Research*, 14 (November), 509-516.
- Traynor, Kenneth (1981), "A Benefit Analysis of Higher Education Using Multiple Discriminant Analysis," *Marketing of Services*, James H. Donnelly and William R. George, eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Tuckman, Howard P. and Cyril F. Chang (1986), "Competitive Conditions and Hospital Strategies: A Memphis Case Study," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 6 (December), 34-43.
- Tybout, Alice M., John R. Hauser and Frank S. Koppelman (1978), "Consumer Oriented Transportation Planning: An Integrated Methodology for Modeling Consumer Perceptions, Preference and Behavior," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 5, H. Keith Hunt, ed. Chicago: Association for Consumer Research.
- Umesh, U. N. (1987), "Strategies for Transit Services Using Consumer Preferences," *Advances in Nonprofit Marketing*, Vol. 2, Russell W. Belk ed. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- Vaughn, Ronald, Joseph Pitlik and Behram Hansotia (1978), "Understanding University Choice: A Multi-Attribute Approach," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 5, H. Keith Hunt, ed. Chicago: Association for Consumer Research.
- Walters, A., J. Mangold and E. G. P. Haran (1976), "A Comprehensive Planning Model for Long-Range Academic Strategies," *Management Science*, 22 (March), 727-738.
- Weinberg, Charles B. (1980), "Marketing Mix Decision Rules for Nonprofit Organizations," *Research in Marketing*, Vol. 3. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- (1986), "Arts Plan: Implementation, Evolution, and Usage," *Marketing Science*, 2 (Spring), 143-158.
- and Kenneth M. Shachmut (1978), "Arts Plan: A Model Based System for Use in Planning a Performing Arts Series," *Management Science*, 24 (February), 654-664.
- Williams, Jerome D. (1985), "Cable Television: New Electronic Media for New Nonprofit Marketing Strategies," *Advances in Nonprofit Marketing*, Vol. 1, Russell W. Belk ed. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- Wilms, Grant, Stephen W. Kiefer, James Shanteau, and Patricia McIntyre (1987), "Knowledge and Image of Body Organs: Impact on Willingness to Donate," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 14, Melanie Wallendorf and Paul Anderson, eds. Provo, UT: Association for Consumer Research.

- Wood, Yan R. and Jagdip Singh (1986), "Strategic Planning for Health Care Markets: A Framework and Case Study in Analyzing Diagnosis Related Groups," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 6 (September), 19-28.
- Woods, Walter A. (1987), "Classical Aesthetics and Arousal Theory: Implications for Fine Arts Marketing," *Advances in Nonprofit Marketing*, Vol. 2, Russell W. Belk ed. Greenwich, CT: JAI Press Inc.
- Wortzel, Lawrence H. (1976), "The Behavior of the Health Care Consumer: A Selective Review," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 7, Jerry C. Olson ed. Ann Arbor, MI: Association for Consumer Research.
- Yalch, Richard F. (1975), "Attribution Theory and Voter Choice," *Advances in Consumer Research*, Vol. 2, Mary Jane Schlinger, ed. Chicago: Association for Consumer Research.
- Yavas, Ugur and Glen Riecken (1981), "Volunteer Recruitment: A Marketing Approach," *The Changing Marketing Environment: New Theories and Applications*, Kenneth Bernhardt et al, ed. Chicago: American Marketing Association.
- Yorke, D. A. (1984), "Marketing and Non-Profit-Marketing Organisations," *European Journal of Marketing*, 18 (2), 17-22.
- and R. R. Jones (1984), "Marketing and Museums," *European Journal of Marketing*, 18 (2), 90-99.
- Zallocko, Ronald L., W. Benoy Joseph and Harvey Doremus (1984), "Strategic Market Planning for Hospitals," *Journal of Health Care Marketing*, 4 (Spring), 19-28.
- Zeithaml, Valarie A. (1981), "How Consumer Evaluation Processes Differ Between Goods and Services," *Marketing of Services*, James H. Donnelly and William R. George, eds. Chicago: American Marketing Association.